

# **City of Fayetteville, NC Audit Committee Meeting**

October 26, 2023 @3:00 pm

1<sup>st</sup> Floor – Lafayette Room

433 Hay Street, Fayetteville, NC 28301



## Audit Committee Meeting October 26, 2023 @ 3:00 pm

### **AGENDA**

- 1. Call to Order
- 2. Approval of Agenda
- 3. Approval of Meeting Minutes
- 4. Discussion of Committee Officer Appointments
- 5. Management Reports (Summary presented by Internal Audit staff)
  - a. Quarterly Management Implementation Status Report
- 6. Internal Audit Activities (Presented by Internal Audit staff):
  - a. Procurement Card Follow-up Audit
  - b. Current Projects
- 7. Adjournment

#### Attachments:

- a) Draft Meeting Minutes August 31, 2023
- b) Quarterly Management Implementation Status Report 1st Quarter FYE24
- c) Procurement Card Follow-up Audit (A2022-03F)

### FAYETTEVILLE AUDIT COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES LAFAYETTE CONFERENCE ROOM CITY HALL, 433 HAY STREET THURSDAY, AUGUST 31, 2023 3:00 P.M.

Committee Members Present: Ron O'Brien, Chair, Dr. Mfon Akpan, Vice Chair (via Zoom); Johnny

Dawkins, Mayor Pro Tem (via Zoom); D.J. Haire, Council Member (via

Zoom); Derrick Thompson, Council Member (via Zoom)

**Staff Present:** Douglas J. Hewett, City Manager (via Zoom)

Karen McDonald, City Manager (via Zoom)

Jodi Phelps, Chief of Staff

Jeffery Yates, Assistant City Manager Jodi Picarella, Chief Financial Officer Rose Rasmussen, Internal Audit Director

Michael Gibson, Parks, Recreation, & Maintenance Director (via Zoom)

Lachelle Pullium, Assistant City Attorney (via Zoom) Kimberly Toon, Assistant Chief Financial Officer

Chief Ronnie Willett, Assistant Fire Chief (Departed at 3:11 p.m.)

Kellie Berg, Assistant Police Chief

Daniel Edwards, Public Services Assistant Director (via Zoom) Jessica Legette, Parks, Recreation, & Maintenance Assistant Director

(via Zoom)

Todd Joyce, Police Major (via Zoom)

Christina Zimmerman, Senior Internal Auditor

Kathleen Johnson, Budget & Evaluation Analyst (via Zoom)

Jennifer Ayre, Deputy City Clerk

### 1. CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Ron O'Brien called the meeting to order at 3:00 p.m.

### 2. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

MOTION: Council Member Thompson moved to approve the agenda

SECOND: Dr. Mfon Akpan VOTE: UNANIMOUS (5-0)

### 3. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

August 7, 2023

MOTION: Council Member Thompson moved to approve the August 7, 2023 meeting minutes.

SECOND: Mayor Pro Tem Dawkins VOTE: UNANIMOUS (5-0)

### 4. MANAGEMENT REPORTS

### A. Quarterly Management Implementation Status Report

Ms. Rose Rasmussen, Internal Audit Director provided an update on the management implementation status for A2019-04 Residential Solid Waste Fees; A2020-04 Vector Fleet Contract Audit; A2022-01 Fire Kronos Implementation Audit; A2022-04 Subrecipient Grant Monitoring Audit and A2022-03 Procurement Card.

A2019-04 Residential Solid Waste Fees is currently partially implemented. A request for proposal will be completed for a new Fleet Onboarding Management System. Once the system is in place the policies and addresses will be updated in the system.

A2022-04 Vector Fleet Contract currently has one recommendation not implemented. The recommendation is to establish a fleet committee to hold regular meetings. Currently, fleet meetings are regularly held with separate departments, but not as an official committee.

A2022-01 Fires Kronos Implementation is currently only partially implemented. The recommendation is to update policies in relation to timekeeping and payroll. The Fire Department is waiting on the integration the scheduling software into the city's time keeping software. Once the integration is complete policies will be updated. Discussion ensued.

A2022-4 Subrecipient Grant Monitoring and A2022-03 Procurement Card have had all recommendations have been implemented as of July 1, 2023. Internal Audit will follow-up to confirm implementation and efficiency.

### 5. INTERNAL AUDIT ACTIVITIES

### A. PRM Nonresident Fees Implementation Follow-up Audit

Ms. Rasmussen stated the original Parks & Recreation Nonresident Fee Implementation Audit was completed in January 2019 and included seven (7) agreed upon recommendations. All recommendations were reported as implanted as of January 2022, however the follow-up audit identified that three (3) have been fully implemented, two (2) partially implemented, and two (2) not implemented.

### Implemented Recommendations:

- Amending the nonresident fee policy
- Updating the existing fee schedule for additional transparency
- Updating the policy to address documentation needed to validate fee have been fully implemented.

### Partially Implemented:

- Quality Review Processes
  - O The department has a process in place for athletic fees for quality review, audit recommends putting in a process for all fees.
- Training to Parks & Recreation Personnel on when to charge Resident or Nonresident fees
  - O Some training has been provided, however, the policy was just recently updated as of August 1,2023. Internal Audit recommends ensuring all employees are trained according to the new policy.

### Not Implemented:

- Strengthening of Internal Controls for RecTrac Administration and Access
  - Internal Audit's two recommendations were to move RecTrac administration to the IT Department and limit administrative access of employees in RecTrac. Management stated there is higher access requirement necessary for employees to perform job duties and will create a negative impact to daily operations.
  - Management and Internal Audit jointly decided to continue to allow Parks & Recreation employees to have administrate access an additional control would need to be implemented to mitigate any possible risk. A process will be created where someone within parks & recreation will review an audit log monthly for any changes that are made in the system. The review must be completed by a staff member that does not have administrative access rights within the system.

MOTION: Council Member Thompson moved to accept the Parks, Recreation, &

Management Nonresidential Fees Implementation Follow-up Audit

SECOND: Council Member Haire VOTE: UNANIMOUS (5-0)

#### B. Police Confidential Funds Audit

Ms. Rasmussen stated the Police Confidential Funds Audit is an annual audit. This fund is administered by the Vice Investigations Division and has an annual budget of \$100,000.00. The scope of the audit was June 1 2022- May 31, 2023. Out of twenty (20) employees that use the funds, six (6) employees were reviewed and included 61 transactions sampled totaling \$25,295.00.

Based on work performed by the Internal Audit Department, it was concluded the confidential funds were administered in accordance with established procedures, internal controls were in place, and no significant exceptions were noted. Discussion ensued. Mr. O'Brien recommended tracking how many of the transactions led to arrests and/or convictions.

MOTION: Council Member Thompson moved to accept the Police Confidential Funds

Audit

SECOND: Dr. Mfon Akpan VOTE: UNANIMOUS (5-0)

### C. FY2024 Audit Plan

Ms. Rasmussen stated the fiscal year 2024 Audit Plan includes two carry forward audits, three new audits, three follow-up audits, two required annual reviews, and three consulting services.

The Carry Forward Audits include, A2022-02 Kronos Implementation for Police and A2020-02F Accounts Payable Timeliness for a total of 100 required hours.

The New Audits are A2024-01 Police Department Confidential Funds, A2024-02 Transit Grants, and A2024-03 Fleet Management for a total of 1040 required hours.

Internal Audit will complete Follow-up Audits on A2020-01F Police Payroll, A2022-03F Procurement Card, and A2022-04F Sub Recipient Grant Monitoring for a total of 380 required hours.

The Annual Reviews will include R2024-01 Proxy Card and R2024-02 Conflict of Interest for a total of 500 hours.

Internal Audit will provide Consulting Services on C2024-01 HUB HCM Oracle Access Controls Review, C2024-02 HUB HCM Payroll Implementation, and C2024-03 Transit Cash Handling for a total of 1016 required hours.

The vacancy in the department that will affect the number of hours implemented for each audit, will be filled with an internal candidate effective September 25, 2023. Mr. O'Brien asked if being fully staffed will be sufficient or are more positions necessary? Ms. Rasmussen stated that more people could always be helpful. Discussion ensued. The second item affecting the hours. Discussion ensued.

MOTION: Council Member Dawkins moved to approve the Fiscal Year 2024 Audit Plan

**SECOND:** Council Member Haire **VOTE:** UNANIMOUS (5-0)

### 6. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business the meeting adjourned at 3:47 p.m.



October 26, 2023

Members of the Audit Committee.

Enclosed is the updated Quarterly Management Implementation Status Report.

The attached report provides members of the Audit Committee with an update on the progress of management's implementation of recommendations made by the Office of Internal Audit. Departmental management updates will be provided quarterly at each regularly scheduled Audit Committee Meeting.

A short summary of the progress updates are provided to allow a quick assessment of the audit report recommendations NOT fully implemented. The attached report represents updates given by management on the progress made to implement Internal Audit's recommendations. Except as otherwise noted, no assessment on the progress of the recommendations has been performed by the Office of Internal Audit.

Please provide us with any questions or ideas for improving this report to enhance your ability to monitor the effective implementation of recommendations.

A summary of the report will be presented. We welcome discussion on the management updates.

Respectfully, Rose Rasmussen, CIA Internal Audit Director

	<u>Recommendations</u> Partially Not				Not	
	Date Released	Issued	Accepted	Implemented	Implemented	Implemented
Contract Practices and Procedures A2016-06	October 2017	3	3	3	0	0
Performances Measures A2018-04	January 2019	4	4	4	0	0
Code Violation Enforcement and Collections A2019-06	August 2019	7	7	7	0	0
Residential Solid Waste Fees A2019-04	October 2019	5	5	3	1	1
Police Payroll A2020-01	August 2020					
Police Department		14	14	14	0	0
Finance Department		4	4	4	0	0
Accounts Payable Timeliness A2020-02	January 2021	5	5	5	0	0
Wireless Communication Usage A2021-02	August 2021	7	6	6	0	0
Vector Fleet Contract A2020-04	November 2021	3	3	2	0	1
Fire Kronos Implementation A2022-01	January 2022	4	4	2	2	0
Subrecipient Grant Monitoring A2022-04	August 2022	8	8	8	0	0

<sup>\*</sup>This Report does not include the Permitting and Inspections Follow-up Audit.

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date	
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – August 31, 2023	Management Follow-up Response – October 26, 2023	
A2019	A2019-04 Residential Solid Waste Fees				

		August 31, 2023:		
	Implemented	Partially Implemented	Not Implemented	Total
	3	1	1	5
	*Th	is report reflects responses for the 2 out		
2.2	Develop a process to add, activate	Management concurs with the need	Partially Implemented	Partially Implemented
	and inactivate addresses in	to develop a process to add, activate		
	Fleetmind as needed to maintain	and inactivate addresses in	Although some Fleetmind	Although some Fleetmind
	current, accurate, valid data.	Fleetmind to maintain a current,	upgrades are complete, the	upgrades are complete, the
		accurate, and valid data base.	Fleetmind system is not	Fleetmind system is not
		However, this process is contingent	consistent. SW will complete an	consistent. SW will complete an
		upon the outcomes of	RFP for the Fleet-onboarding	RFP for the Fleet-onboarding
		'Recommendation #1'. Further, full	system before the end of FY24.	system before the end of FY24.
		implementation of these processes		_
		involves compliance and	Routesmart street data is	Routesmart street data is
		cooperation from entities outside the	outdated and will be updated in	outdated and will be updated in
		direct control and influence of the	FY24.	FY24.
		Solid Waste Division such as CoF's		
		Planning Division, Cumberland	Upon completing	Upon completing
		County and FleetMind Vendor.	"Recommendation 1" and	"Recommendation 1" and
		Implementation dates provided	updating Routesmart and	updating Routesmart and
		below are for those activities that are	Fleetmind, SW will vet the	Fleetmind, SW will vet the
		within the direct control and	onboarding data to align with	onboarding data to align with
		influence of the Solid Waste	any necessary ordinance revisions.	any necessary ordinance revisions.
		Division as well as what can be	revisions.	revisions.
		accomplished within Council		
		appropriated budgetary limits.		
		Responsible Party: Public Services		
		Director		
		Director		

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – August 31, 2023	Management Follow-up Response – October 26, 2023
A2019	-04 Residential Solid Waste Fees			
Γ				
		Implementation Date: Public Services Solid Waste Division will develop a process to add, activate and inactivate addresses in Fleetmind to maintain a current, accurate, and valid data base by June 30, 2022 contingent upon		
2.3	Develop comprehensive written policies and procedures to maintain Fleetmind data integrity, once the processes are established.	Management responses.  Management concurs with the need to develop comprehensive written policies and procedures to maintain Fleetmind data integrity. However, this process is contingent upon the outcomes of 'Recommendation #1". Further, full implementation of these processes involves compliance and cooperation from entities outside the direct control and influence of the Solid Waste Division such as CoF's Planning Division, Cumberland County and FleetMind Vendor. Implementation dates provided below are for those activities that are within the direct control and influence of the Solid Waste Division as well as what can be accomplished within Council appropriated budgetary limits.	Not Implemented  The SW team will commence writing policies and procedures to uphold data integrity (the overall accuracy, completeness, and consistency of data) for Fleetmind and Routesmart following the Council's approval of the SW Ordinance and updating Routesmart street data. In FY24, the staff will also upgrade the onboarding system to replace Fleetmind. The new ordinance took effect on July 1, 2023.	Not Implemented  The SW team will commence writing policies and procedures to uphold data integrity (the overall accuracy, completeness, and consistency of data) for Fleetmind and Routesmart following the Council's approval of the SW Ordinance and updating Routesmart street data. In FY24, the staff will also upgrade the onboarding system to replace Fleetmind. The new ordinance took effect on July 1, 2023.

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – August 31, 2023	Management Follow-up Response – October 26, 2023
A2019-	-04 Residential Solid Waste Fees			
		Responsible Party: Public Services Director		
		Implementation Date: Public Services Solid Waste Division will develop comprehensive written policies and procedures to maintain Fleetmind data integrity by June 30, 2022 contingent upon management responses.		

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date	
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – August 31, 2023	Management Follow-up Response – October 26, 2023	
A2020-	A2020-04 Vector Fleet Contract Audit				

		Status of Recommendations on	August 31, 2023:	
Implemente	ed	Partially Implemented	Not Implemented	Total
2		0	1	3
	*Th	is report reflects responses for the 1 ou	tstanding recommendation.	
1.3 Establish a Fle Committee c	et Maintenance omprised of	a. Management believes establishing a "Fleet Committee" could be	Not Implemented	Not Implemented
representatives from		valuable and provide some desired	Fleet has established weekly	Weekly meetings with
departments that	t utilize fleet	clarity in accountability, areas of	meeting times with departments	departments have been
services. A Co		responsibility, establishment of agreed Standard Operating	to discuss maintenance concerns, status, new equipment	established, and invites have been sent to appropriate parties.
Manager's Office		Procedures (SOP's) and process	and other issues or concerns that	con sent to appropriate parties.
group. The Com		improvements. The resulting	arise.	Policies are being updated,
should be to add		recommendations will be either		waiting for final results from
issues, such as		implemented or submitted to the	Fleet has a centralized policy but	consulting group to finalize the
policies and p		City Manager's Office for	needs to continue to update with	appropriate policies and
resolving fleet		consideration(s).	changes.	procedures.
issues. The Fleet should be to staff	_	b. Management will establish a	A Fleet Maintenance Committee	
and bring topics an		weekly scheduled meeting with the	still needs to be identified and	
Committee for dis		Fleet Management and Maintenance	have regular meetings.	
	<b></b>	Staff: Fleet Manager will facilitate	in to regular meetings.	
		this meeting. In addition		
		management will schedule a		
		monthly meeting with the full Fleet		
		Committee, facilitated by a Staff		
		member from the City Manager's		
		Office.		

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – August 31, 2023	Management Follow-up Response – October 26, 2023
A2020-	04 Vector Fleet Contract Audit			
		Responsible Party: Chief Financial Officer or his/her Designee		
		Implementation Date:  a. January 31, 2022 – Seek City Manager's Office approval to establish committee and select facilitator and members.		
		b. February 28, 2022 – Conduct kick-off meeting		

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date	
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – August 31, 2023	Management Follow-up Response – October 26, 2023	
A2022-	A2022-01 Fire Kronos Implementation Audit				

		Status of Recommendations on	August 31, 2023:	
	Implemented	Partially Implemented	Not Implemented	Total
	2	2	0	4
	*Thi	is report reflects responses for the 2 out	tstanding recommendations.	
1.1	Work with the Human Resource	Now that the transition is nearly	Partially Implemented	Partially Implemented
	Development Department and the	complete, the department can codify		
	City Attorney's Office and	its practices, aligned with the	A written draft of the process	A written draft of the process
	establish written payroll policies.	functionality of the new systems.	under the current system has	under the current system has
		The department has been made	been completed. The department	been completed. The department
		aware of a pending upgrade to the	is still relegated to waiting upon	is still relegated to waiting upon
		Kronos and Telestaff software	the system upgrades to be	the system upgrades and system
		platforms that necessitates delay of	completed before codifying into	error corrections to be
		implementing any new policies until	policy. The department has not	completed before codifying into
		system changes are known. In the	received any feedback from the	policy.
		interim, the department has	third party consultant at the time	
		requested review of its payroll	of this report.	The department is working
		practices by a third party consultant.		directly with UKG for technical
		The department plans to have its	No payroll related issues were	issues related to Kronos/Faypay
		new processes defined by policy no	noted during the third party	integration issues.
		later than June 30, 2022.	review.	
				Payroll issues are persistent.
		Responsible Party: Deputy Chief	•	Overtime Codes, Fire-leveling
		of Human Resources	upgrade tentatively planned for	and Time off request errors
			November 2022.	continue to exist in the Kronos
		<b>Implementation Date:</b> June 30,		system.
		2022	Integration of department's	
			staffing program, time keeping	
			program and payroll system was	

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – August 31, 2023	Management Follow-up Response – October 26, 2023
A2022	-01 Fire Kronos Implementation Au	ıdit		
1.2	Update and maintain documented payroll procedures to align with current payroll processes. The procedures should be sufficient for alternate employees to process departmental payroll.	Now that the transition is nearly complete, the department can codify its practices, aligned with the functionality of the new systems. The department has been made aware of a pending upgrade to the Kronos and Telestaff software platforms that necessitates delay of implementing any new policies until system changes are known. In the interim, the department has requested review of its payroll practices by a third party consultant. The department plans to have its new processes defined by policy no later than June 30, 2022.	initiated in March 2023 but many errors have been presented without an identified resolution. These issues have to be resolved before written guidance can be finalized and codified. It is still a work in progress.  Partially Implemented  A written draft of the process under the current system has been completed. The department is still relegated to waiting upon the system upgrades to be completed before codifying into policy. The department has not received any feedback from the third party consultant at the time of this report. Adequate guidance in included in the draft document to effectuate biweekly payroll.	Integration of department's staffing program, time keeping program and payroll system was initiated in March 2023 but many errors have been presented without an identified resolution. These issues have to be resolved before written guidance can be finalized and codified. It is still a work in progress.  Partially Implemented  A written draft of the process under the current system has been completed. The department is still relegated to waiting upon the system errors to be corrected before codifying into policy.  Guidance included in the original draft document, required to effectuate bi-weekly payroll, will likely need significant revision, once the technical errors have been addressed.

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date		
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – August 31, 2023	Management Follow-up Response – October 26, 2023		
A2022	A2022-01 Fire Kronos Implementation Audit					
		Responsible Party: Deputy Chief of Human Resources  Implementation Date: June 30, 2022	Latest update indicates Kronos upgrade tentatively planned for November 2022.  Integration of department's staffing program, time keeping program and payroll system was initiated in March 2023 but many errors have been presented without an identified resolution. These issues have to be resolved before written guidance can be finalized and codified. It is still a work in progress.			



## **Procurement Card Follow-up (2022-03F)**

October 2023

Internal Audit Director

Rose Rasmussen

**Senior Internal Auditor** 

Christina Zimmerman



Date: October 26, 2023

To: Jody Picarella, Chief Financial Officer

Kimberly Toon, Assistant Chief Financial Officer - Procurement

From: Rose Rasmussen, Internal Audit Director

Cc: Audit Committee

Douglas J. Hewett, City Manager

Re: Procurement Card Follow-up Audit (A2022-03F)

Originally Issued January 26, 2023

The Office of Internal Audit completed a follow-up audit on the Procurement Card Audit approved by the Audit Committee on January 26, 2023.

The original report can be found through the Office of Internal Audit website at: https://www.fayettevillenc.gov/city-services/city-manager-s-office/internal-audit/internal-audit-reports.

### Objective and Scope

Determine whether management implemented corrective actions to the audit recommendation reported by the Office of Internal Audit.

The scope of the follow-up audit was limited to the findings and accepted recommendation in the original audit of procurement cards. This included review of Procurement Card Policy #312 with a revised date of August 1, 2023 and associated annual refresher training.

### Background

The original audit report, dated January 2023, had one agreed upon recommendation. The audit provided improvements for management in compliance (policy, procedures and training).

As of the August 31, 2023 Corrective Action Plan provided to the Audit Committee, the Department reported the accepted recommendation was fully implemented.

### Summary Results

Based on review of the updated City of Fayetteville Procurement Card Policy #312 with a revised date of August 1, 2023 and annual refresher training, Internal Audit determined the Department fully implemented the recommendation.

### **Conclusion**

The Office of Internal Audit has concluded the Procurement Card Follow-up Audit and expresses appreciation for the assistance provided by Department staff.

### Appendix A:

**DEPARTMENT**: Finance

**AUDIT:** Procurement Card (A2022-03) **ORIGINALLY ISSUED:** January 26, 2023

The Office of Internal Audit has completed follow-up on the Procurement Card Audit approved by the Audit Committee on January 26, 2023. Internal Audit's objective was to determine whether management implemented corrective actions to the audit recommendation reported by the Office of Internal Audit.

## Results IMPLEMENTED

1

Finding	Summany of Opiginal	Current Observation	Implementation Disposition:					
Number	Summary of Original Recommendation		Initial	Reported	Status as of			
	Dated January 26, 2023		Implementation	Implementation	October 26, 2023			
	Dated Galldary 20, 2025		Date	Date				
1. Procurement Card Program Revision 2 Policy #312 was not updated.								
1	Finance Department	Procurement Card Program Policy	July 01, 2023	July 2023	Implemented			
	management should update	#312 with a revision date of		CAP DATE				
	Policy #312 along with	August 1, 2023 addressed all		August 31, 2023				
	corresponding training materials	topics listed in the original						
	and include but not limit the	recommendation. Associated						
	update to:	annual refresher training was						
	• Use of the Oracle online	updated and distributed to COF						
	purchasing platform;	procurement card holders via						
	• Restrictions on use of	PowerDMS on October 1, 2023.						
	personal online shopping							
	accounts;							
	• Restrictions on shipping to							
	home addresses;							

•	Requirements and definition of business purpose with examples provided;		
•	Documentation requirements and restrictions for food purchases;		
•	·		
•			