City of Fayetteville, NC Audit Committee Meeting January 28, 2021 @ 3:00 pm Virtual Meeting Via Zoom



Audit Committee Meeting January 28, 2021 @ 3:00pm Virtual Meeting Via Zoom

AGENDA

- 1. Call to Order
- 2. Approval of Agenda
- 3. Approval of Meeting Minutes
- 4. Amendment to Audit Committee By-Laws
- 5. Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2020 Comprehensive Annual Financial Report and Audit Results (*Presented by Robert E. Bittner III, CPA, MBA, RSM US LLP*)
- 6. Internal Audit Activities (Presented by Elizabeth Somerindyke, Internal Audit Director):
 - a. WEX Fuel Card Follow-up Police (A2019-05F)
 - b. Accounts Payable Timeliness (A2020-02)
- 7. Other Business (Presented by Elizabeth Somerindyke, Internal Audit Director)
 - a. Annual Audit Plan Proposed Engagements for FY2021
- 8. Financial Audit Preparations for Fiscal Year Ending June 30, 2021 (Requested by Jay Toland, Chief Financial Officer)
- 9. Management Reports (Informational Purposes Only)
 - a. Internal Audit Annual Report FY2020
 - b. Quarterly Management Implementation Status Report

10. Adjournment

Attachments:

- a) Draft Meeting Minutes August 6, 2020
- b) Amended Audit Committee By-Laws
- c) WEX Fuel Card Follow-up Police (A2019-05F)
- d) Accounts Payable Timeliness (A2020-02)
- e) Annual Audit Plan FY 2021
- f) Internal Audit Annual Report FY 2020
- g) Quarterly Management Implementation Status Report 2nd Quarter FYE21

AUDIT COMMITTEE QUARTERLY MEETING MINUTES ZOOM THURSDAY, AUGUST 6, 2020 3:00 P.M.

Committee Members Present: Council Member Johnny Dawkins (Chairman)

Council Member Larry Wright Council Member Yvonne Kinston Ms. Evelyn Shaw, PWC Chairwoman

Mr. Warren O'Brian, FTCC Accounting Instructor

Ms. Amy Samperton, FTCC Director of Procurement & Equipment

(Vice Chair)

Staff Present: Mr. Doug Hewett, City Manager

Ms. Karen McDonald, City Attorney

Dr. Telly Whitfield, Assistant City Manager

Ms. Elizabeth Somerindyke, Internal Audit Director

Ms. Rose Rasmussen, Senior Internal Audit

Ms. Amanda Rich, Internal Auditor

Mr. Jay Toland, Interim Chief Financial Officer Mr. Gerald Newton, Development Services Director Ms. Sheila Thomas-Ambat, Director of Public Services

Chief Mike Hill, Fayetteville Fire Department

Chief Gina Hawkins, Fayetteville Police Department

Ms. Jennifer Ayre, Deputy City Clerk

1.0 Call to Order

Council Member Wright called the meeting to order at 3:00 p.m. and welcomed everyone to the zoom meeting.

2.0 Welcome New Audit Committee Members

Ms. Elizabeth Somerindyke, Audit Director introduced the new Audit Committee member, Mr. Warren O'Brian. Mr. O'Brian is a retired Army officer whom served for 21 years. He has now been at FTCC as an Accounting Instructor for 26 years. Council Member Dawkins thanked Mr. O'Brian for being willing to serve on the Audit Board.

3.0 Approval of Agenda

MOTION: Ms. Evelyn Shaw SECOND: Ms. Amy Samperton UNANIMOUS (6-0)

4.0 Approval of Meeting Minutes

January 23, 2020

MOTION: Ms. Evelyn Shaw SECOND: Ms. Amy Samperton UNANIMOUS (6-0)

5.0 Discussion of Appointment of Officers

Council Member Wright stated the current chair has rotated off and the committee is now required to reappoint officers.

MOTION: Council Member Wright moved to nominated Council Member Johnny

Dawkins as Chair

SECOND: Council Member Kinston

VOTE: UNANIMOUS (6-0)

MOTION: Ms. Shaw moved to nominated Ms. Amy Samperton as Vice Chair

SECOND: Council Member Wright VOTE: UNANIMOUS (6-0)

6.0 Internal Audit Activities (Presented by Elizabeth Somerindyke, Internal Audit Director)

a. WEX Fuel Card Follow-up Audit – Fire and Finance (A2019-05F)

The objective of this audit was to determine if the original audit recommendations were implemented. A five percent (5%) sample from September 30, 2019 – November 20, 2019 was selected to review and audit from the original eight (8) findings from May 2019.

The WEX Card agreement has been with the State of North Carolina since April of 2014. The cards are used at participating locations as an alternate to the City fueling site.

All original eight (8) findings presented were implemented.

Discussion ensued.

MOTION: Council Member Wright moved to accept the Finance WEX Fuel Card

Follow-up Audit

SECOND: Ms. Shaw

VOTE: UNANIMOUS (6-0)

The Fire Department had an additional six (6) recommendations required for implementation regarding the WEX Fuel Card Audit. All original finding recommendations presented were implemented.

Discussion ensued.

MOTION: Council Member Wright moved to accept the Fire WEX Fuel Card Follow-

up Audit

SECOND: Ms. Samperton
VOTE: UNANIMOUS (6-0)

b. Police Department Payroll Audit (A2020-01)

Ms. Somerindyke stated the Internal Audit Department conducted an audit of the Fayetteville Police Department's Timekeeping and Payroll Process. The objects of the audit were to determine if: time and attendance information agreed with appropriately approved and authorized supporting documentation; including determination if supporting documentation allows for appropriate audit trail; individual and overall time approval were appropriate; payroll changes were appropriately supported, authorized, and verified; hours paid agreed with the supporting documentation; and compensation was in accordance with relevant laws, regulations, guidelines, policies, and procedures.

The audit initially sampled eighteen (18%) percent of Police Department personnel from January 1, 2019 to November 26, 2019 and vacation accruals from January 1, 2019 – August 30, 2019 which equaled six pay periods and three FLSA periods. Internal Audit later selected an additional fifty-one (51%) percent for review due to there being turnover in the original sample. The sample did exclude the E911 communication employees.

Eight (8) findings were identified.

Finding 1: A manual timekeeping process was used which included unnecessary work; ultimately caused payroll errors and impacted timekeeping records. Management partially concurred with the recommendations.

Finding 2: Paper timekeeping forms lacked clarity causing payroll processing errors. Management concurred with the recommendations.

Finding 3: Processing hours worked in the incorrect 28-day FLSA period caused errors in pay. Management concurred with the recommendations.

Finding 4: Payroll authorization reports from JD Edwards were not reviewed to timecards. Management concurred with reservation with the recommendations and will not implement Internal Audit's recommendation.

Finding 5: Payroll departmental operating procedures required updating to ensure FLSA compliance and clear guidance for all personnel. Management concurred with reservation with the recommendations.

Finding 6: Comprehensive training was not provided to personnel involved in the timekeeping and payroll process. Management did concur with reservations and the Finance department did concurred with the recommendations.

Finding 7: Processing timecards for law enforcement personnel on a 2-week basis would improve efficiency. Management partially concurred with the recommendations

Finding 8: There was no assurance exempt personnel were reporting leave time. Management concurred with the recommendations.

Discussion ensued.

MOTION: Mr. O'Brian moved to accept the Police Department Payroll Audit

SECOND: Council Member Wright VOTE: UNANIMOUS (6-0)

7.0 Quarterly Management Implementation Status Report

The purpose of this report is to provide members of the Audit Committee with an update on the progress of management's implementation of recommendations made by the Office of Internal Audit. This report was provided to committee members for informational purposes but was not presented.

8.0 Adjournment

There	heing no	further	huginege	the m	neeting .	adjourned	at 1.36	n m
THEFE	oung no	rururci	ousiness,	uic ii	iccung .	aujourneu	at 4. 50	р.ш.

Respectfully submitted,	
JENNIFER AYRE	COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNNY DAWKINS
Deputy City Clerk 080620	Chairman



MEMORANDUM

January 28, 2021

TO: Audit Committee Members

FROM: Elizabeth Somerindyke, Internal Audit Director

RE: Amend Audit Committee By-Laws

At the November 9, 2020 City Council meeting, Council members adopted a revision to the voting composition of the Audit Committee Charter.

The Audit Committee Charter was historically comprised of three City Council members, one member from the Fayetteville Public Works Commission and two members of the business community, all voting members of the Audit Committee. The City Manager and Internal Audit Director are ex-officio non-voting members. The revised Audit Committee Charter changed the voting composition of the Audit Committee to reflect the member of the Fayetteville Public Works Commission to also be an exofficio non-voting member.

Article II, Membership, Section 1 of the attached Audit Committee By-Laws is being amended to reflect this revision. Additionally, with the change in voting composition, Article V, Quorum, Section 1 is being amended to reflect three members of the Audit Committee shall constitute a quorum.

Attachment: Amended By-Laws with changes incorporated.

City of Fayetteville AUDIT COMMITTEE Fayetteville, North Carolina

By-Laws	

ARTICLE I

PURPOSE

SECTION 1. The Audit Committee has been established as an advisory committee whose primary purpose is to assist the City Council in fulfilling its oversight responsibilities for the overall stewardship of the City's financial affairs.

The responsibilities of the Audit Committee shall be:

- a) Review and reassess the adequacy of this Charter at least every two years, with any revision submitted to the City Council for approval.
- b) Provide an avenue of communication among the City Council, city management, internal audit, and the independent auditors.
- c) Ensure the City's internal control systems are in place and implemented, including information technology security and control.
- d) Ensure City management implements internal audit report recommendations.
- e) Approve the annual audit plan and all major changes to the plan.
- f) Review the internal audit charter, activities, staffing, and organizational structure of the internal audit function with the City Manager and the Internal Audit Director and recommend any changes to the City Council.
- g) Submit an Annual Report of Audit Committee actions and recommendations to the City Council.
- h) Recommend to the City Council the selection of the independent auditors.
- i) Continually evaluate the independence of the independent auditors.
- Review the City's CAFR, management letter and management's response and forward findings to the City Council.

ARTICLE II

MEMBERSHIP

SECTION 1. The City Council of the City of Fayetteville shall appoint three City Council members, one member from the Fayetteville Public Works Commission and two members of the business community with experience in the finance industry to be voting members of the Audit Committee. The City Manager, one member from the Fayetteville Public Works Commission and the Internal Audit Director shall be an ex-officio non-voting members of the Audit Committee.

SECTION 2. Members from the business community shall be appointed for a term of two years. The member from the Fayetteville Public Works Commission shall be appointed for a two year term. The terms of the City Council members shall be appointed for a two year term consistent with their terms of election.

ARTICLE III

OFFICERS

- **SECTION 1.** *Enumeration of Offices* The officers of the Committee shall be a Chairperson and Vice-Chairperson.
- **SECTION 2.** *Election of Officers and Term of Office.* The officers shall each be elected at the regularly scheduled meeting held in July, take office immediately upon election, and serve a one year term or until a successor is elected at the subsequent years quarterly meeting held in July.
- **SECTION 3.** Vacant terms of officers may be filled through action taken by the Committee. An officer appointed to fill a vacancy shall be appointed for the unexpired term of his predecessor in office.
- **SECTION 4.** The Chairperson shall preside at all meetings of the Committee and perform such other duties as may be directed by the Committee.
- **SECTION 5.** The Vice Chairperson shall serve as the Chairperson in the absence of the Chairperson.
- **SECTION 6.** The officers shall serve without compensation for their services.

ARTICLE IV

RESIGNATIONS

SECTION 1. In the event that a member chooses to resign from the Audit Committee, such member should notify the Chairperson, in writing. The Chairperson will then immediately notify the members of the Committee of any such resignations. The resignation shall be effective when the notification is received by the Chairperson unless the notification specifies a later time.

ARTICLE V

QUORUM

SECTION 1. Four Three members, excluding the Fayetteville Public Works Commission member, City Manager and Internal Audit Director, shall constitute a quorum.

ARTICLE VI

MEETINGS

SECTION 1. *Regular Meeting*. A regular meeting of the Committee shall be held quarterly on the fourth Thursday during the months of January, April, July, and October at a time and place to be designated by the Committee. All meetings will be open to the public, to the extent required by North Carolina General Statute 143-318.10.

SECTION 2. *Special Meetings.* Special meetings may be called by the Chairperson, or the Vice Chairperson in the absence of the Chairperson, as deemed necessary or desirable. All Special Meetings will be noticed in accordance with North Carolina General Statute.

SECTION 3. The Deputy City Clerk will keep minutes of each meeting and offer them for Committee approval as the first item on the subsequent meeting agenda. The minutes should be distributed to Committee members in draft form within a reasonable time after the meeting and in advance of the subsequent meeting. A copy of the approved minutes will be submitted to the Office of Internal Audit.

SECTION 4. The Chairperson shall approve an agenda in advance of each meeting. The Committee may request any employee of the City or the independent auditors to attend a meeting of the Committee.

ARTICLE VII

AMENDMENTS



TO: City of Fayetteville Audit Committee

FROM: Jay C. Toland, CMA, CFO

DATE: January 28, 2021

RE: Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2020 Comprehensive Annual Financial Report and

Audit Results

Relationship To Strategic Plan:

GOAL V: Sustainable Organizational Capacity, Objective A - To ensure strong financial management with fiduciary accountability and plan for future resource sustainability by aligning resources with City priorities.

Executive Summary:

The City is required by North Carolina state statute and grantor agencies to have an annual audit. The Audit Committee Charter states that the Audit Committee will review the City's Comprehensive Annual Financial Report (CAFR), management letter and management's response, and forward findings to City Council.

Background:

RSM US LLP audited the City's financial statements for the year ended June 30, 2020.

Robbie Bittner, Partner, RSM US LLP will present the results of the audit to the Committee.

The link to the Comprehensive Annual Financial Report for the Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2020 and documents will be provided as soon as they are available, prior to the Audit Committee meeting.



Date: January 28, 2021

To: Gina Hawkins, Police Chief

From: Elizabeth Somerindyke, Internal Audit Director

Cc: Audit Committee

Douglas J. Hewett, City Manager

Re: Follow-up WEX Fuel Card Compliance Audit (Police Department) Originally Issued May 2, 2019

The Office of Internal Audit has completed the follow-up on the WEX Fuel Card Compliance Audit Report approved by the Audit Committee on May 2, 2019. Internal Audit's objective was to determine whether management implemented corrective actions to audit recommendations reported by the Office of Internal Audit.

The audit concluded on November 24, 2020 when management was informed that of the 17 recommendations, four (24%) were implemented, eight (47%) were not implemented, four (24%) partially implemented, and the status of one (6%) could not be determined. Management subsequently implemented seven additional recommendations, bringing the total implemented recommendations to 11 (65%) of the 17 while two (12%) remained not implemented and four (24%) partially implemented.

Results

Finding	Original Audit Recommendation	Implemented/Partially/Not Implemented
#	Dated May 2, 2019	
2.1	Fraud, waste and abuse potentially existed	(see original audit recommendation 9 for
	due to lack of internal controls.	implementation status)
	Internal Audit recommends management of	
	the Police Department implement the	
	recommendations as presented in the audit	
	report to ensure internal controls are	
	established, followed, maintained, and	
	properly documented to include a process	
	to ensure adequate follow-up regarding	
	questionable fueling transactions is	
	conducted.	
2.2	Fraud, waste and abuse potentially existed	NOT IMPLEMENTED
	due to lack of internal controls.	
		Due to segregation of duties, the Finance
	Management within the Police Department	Department assumed administrative
	should consider changing the currently	responsibility over the WEX fuel cards and
	assigned WEX PINs to a confidential PIN.	started issuing new randomly selected WEX
		PINs on March 18, 2020. However, 424 (83%)

of the 511 original non-confidential PINs remained active. Additionally, Internal Audit noted 504 employees held active PINs: • 393 (78%) of 504 employees had 2 active PINs; and 6 (1%) of 504 employees had 3 PINs. Following the conclusion of the audit on November 24, 2020, Internal Audit advised management the recommendation was not implemented. Finance Department management subsequently implemented the recommendation by deactivating the original non-confidential PINs that remained active, to include removing multiple PINs assigned to employees. UNABLE TO DETERMINE STATUS OF 2.3 Fraud, waste and abuse potentially existed due to lack of internal controls. **IMPLEMENTATION** The City's Fuel Card Practices and Procedures Management should ensure WEX fuel card PINs are only assigned to personnel with policy # 315 did not identify personnel that the ability and need to use the fuel cards. would be eligible to have a WEX PIN issued for use with fuel cards. In addition, Police Department management did not provide internal procedures outlining personnel with the ability and need to use fuel cards therefore requiring a WEX PIN to be issued. For these reasons, Internal Audit was not able to determine personnel required to have an active PIN assigned. It was noted that the following personnel were assigned a PIN not actively used: Reserve officers. administrative personnel and one unidentified individual had active PINs with no WEX fuel card usage; and Police Department personnel extended leave to include FMLA and military leave without pay. Following the conclusion of the audit on November 24, 2020, Internal Audit advised management that the ofthe status implementation could not be determined. Police Department management subsequently *implemented* the recommendation by creating a

		procedure that defined when employee PIN's
		should be deactivated.
2.4	Fraud, waste and abuse potentially existed	NOT IMPLEMENTED
	due to lack of internal controls.	
		The City's Fuel Card Practices and Procedures
	Assessment of a secure location in Police	policy # 315 designates suitable locations where
	vehicles and equipment should be	fuel cards should be stored.
	completed to determine the safest location	
	for fuel cards to be maintained. Policies	Due to the COVID 19 Pandemic, Internal Audit
	should note suitable places to store the fuel card in City owned vehicles and equipment.	was unable to observe where fuel cards were maintained.
	card in City owned venicles and equipment.	maintained.
		However, based on Internal Audit inquiry active fuel cards were left in vehicles when
		turned in for disposal. These fuel cards were not
		found in a separately keyed or combination
2.1		lockbox within the vehicles.
3.1	City-wide and/or departmental written	IMPLEMENTED
	policies and procedures governing fuel	
	card usage and management were not	The Police Department did not establish a
	documented.	separate policy related to user responsibilities
		and operational guidance, but used the City's
	Develop written city-wide and	Fuel Card Practices and Procedures policy #
	departmental policies and procedures for	315 which outlines the Department Fuel Card
	using WEX fuel cards, to include	Administrator and provided an appropriate
	identifying the City administrator of the	level of guidance.
	WEX fuel card program. These policies	iever of garagnee.
	and procedures should address the City	
	administrator and user department	
	1	
	responsibilities, as well as operational	
	guidance.	
3.2	City-wide and/or departmental written	<i>IMPLEMENTED</i>
	policies and procedures governing fuel	
	card usage and management were not	The City's Fuel Card Practices and Procedures
	documented.	policy # 315 was distributed to Police
	Y	Department personnel in January 2020 and
	Ensure user departments are provided	continues to be distributed to new employees
	copies of the city-wide policies and	through PowerDMS, a policy management
	procedures and are requested to comply and	software. (See original audit recommendation
	develop internal procedures for fuel cards.	#8 for implementation of training)
		#6 for implementation of training)
	Training should be given to personnel that	
	use WEX fuel cards to ensure	
	understanding and adherence to the policies	
	and procedures.	
3.3	City-wide and/or departmental written	PARTIALLY IMPLEMENTED
	policies and procedures governing fuel	
	card usage and management were not	Based on Internal Audit inquiry, the Police
	documented.	Department established a process to ensure
		PINs were deactivated for personnel no longer
		employed by the City. However, Internal Audit
		improjed by the City. However, internal Madit

A process should be developed to ensure noted 95 active PINs for Police Department when personnel are no longer employed personnel that ended employment with the City. with the City, their WEX fuel card PIN Based on Internal Audit review, Finance started number is deactivated immediately after issuing PINs on March 18, 2020. Of the 95 their last day of employment. PINs: 56 PINs were for personnel that ended employment with the City prior to 3/18/20 indicating the PIN should have been deactivated by the Police Department; and 39 PINs were for personnel that ended employment with the City after 3/18/20 indicating the PIN should have been deactivated by the Finance Department. Following the conclusion of the audit on November 24, 2020, Internal Audit advised management the recommendation was partially implemented. Finance Department management subsequently implemented the recommendation by deactivating the 95 active 3.4 City-wide and/or departmental written *IMPLEMENTED* policies and procedures governing fuel card usage and management were not The City's Fuel Card Practices and Procedures documented. policy # 315 stated the sharing of PINs is not allowed. No instances of PIN sharing were Sharing PIN's should be considered a confirmed, but due to the number of active PINs violation of policy. the likelihood was increased. 4 Departmental NOT IMPLEMENTED management should perform an appropriate level of review. The City's Fuel Card Practices and Procedures should policy # 315, required departments that use fuel Management ensure fue1 consumption of each vehicle and personnel cards to create a departmental process to are monitored and reviewed and any validate transactions and review for abnormalities in fuel consumption, to illegal/fraudulent charges. include purchases of higher grade fuel, is investigated. Additionally, trend analysis Based on Internal Audit inquiry, the Police should be performed to identify and justify Department had not established a process to increases/decreases validate in monthly fuel transactions and review for consumption. illegal/fraudulent charges, monitor fuel consumption or purchases of higher grade fuel. Therefore, the fuel card charges were not Based on the type of apparatus/vehicle, management should establish a mechanism validated, reviewed, or approved for the period to track miles per gallon, assess vehicle audited, September 1, 2019 through August 31, utilization and monitor potential abuse. 2020. Although the WEX system allows fuel card Following the conclusion of the audit on controls, establishment of a process to November 24, 2020, Internal Audit advised review for exceptions is recommended. management the recommendation was not

		implemented. Police Department management subsequently partially implemented the recommendation. The department created procedures that required a monthly review by the Police Department's fuel card administrator, to include monitoring for fuel consumption, type of fuel purchased, abnormalities and exceptions and provided documentation reflecting a review and follow-up of fuel card transactions for November 2020.
5.1	WEX fuel cards were not inventoried and could not be located.	NOT IMPLEMENTED
	Require an annual physical verification of all fuel cards, as evidenced by signature and date of the personnel conducting the inventory and the cardholder assigned to the vehicle.	The City's Fuel Card Practices and Procedures policy # 315 did not require an annual physical verification, although it did specify that departments maintain an inventory record and reconciliation of cards evidenced by documentation.
		In addition the Police Department did not develop internal procedures requiring a physical verification annually.
		A physical verification took place due to card replacements in March and May 2020. The card reissuance required Police Department personnel to sign a form indicating issuance of a new fuel card. Based on Internal Audit inquiry, documentation was not received for all cards issued; therefore, the annual physical verification of all fuel cards was not complete.
		Following the conclusion of the audit on November 24, 2020, Internal Audit advised management the recommendation was not implemented. Police Department management subsequently implemented the recommendation by creating procedures requiring a monthly random sample of fuel cards to be physically verified and documented.
5.2	WEX fuel cards were not inventoried and	IMPLEMENTED
	Could not be located. Unaccounted for fuel cards should be deactivated immediately.	By default, all cards were deactivated due to the card replacements in March and May 2020.
5.3	WEX fuel cards were not inventoried and could not be located.	PARTIALLY IMPLEMENTED
	Management should develop and maintain a listing of vehicles and the fuel cards	The assigned vehicle for each fuel card was listed in the WEX fuel card system. Therefore, an active fuel card list, obtained from the WEX

	·	
	assigned, to include spare and miscellaneous fuel cards.	system, would show the fuel card assigned to each vehicle.
		However, the WEX fuel card system did not identify the location of the spare and miscellaneous fuel cards. The listing provided by the department did not include the location of spare and miscellaneous fuel card and their
		existence was not validated.
5.4	WEX fuel cards were not inventoried and could not be located.	NOT IMPLEMENTED
	Management should ensure cancellation of fuel cards due to disposal/surplus is completed on a timely basis and are followed-up to ensure they are deactivated.	Internal Audit's review noted 88 active WEX fuel cards assigned to units the Police Department identified as a surplus unit or disposed: • 37 Fuel cards were assigned to vehicles that went through the disposal process prior to March 1, 2020 indicating the card should have been deactivated by the Police Department; and
		• 51 fuel cards were assigned to vehicles that went through the disposal process after March 1, 2020 indicating the card should have been deactivated by the Finance Department.
		Following the conclusion of the audit on November 24, 2020, Internal Audit advised management the recommendation was not implemented. Finance Department management subsequently implemented the recommendation by deactivating the 88 active fuel cards. However, an active fuel card report from the WEX reporting system was not provided to validate this statement.
5.5	WEX fuel cards were not inventoried and could not be located. Establish a process in which fuel cards without activity for a given period of time are deactivated.	NOT IMPLEMENTED There was no process in place to review fuel card inactivity to determine if fuel cards needed deactivation.
	are deactivated.	Following the conclusion of the audit on November 24, 2020, Internal Audit advised management the recommendation was not implemented. Police Department management subsequently implemented the recommendation by creating a Police Department WEX/Fuel Card Standard Operating Procedure which requires an unused card report to be run and

	T	
		reviewed monthly for cards that have not been
<i>T. C</i>		utilized in 30 or more days.
5.6	WEX fuel cards were not inventoried and could not be located.	NOT IMPLEMENTED
	could not be toculed.	The Police Department requested personnel to
	The Police Department should immediately	provide the card number in their vehicle or
	complete a physical inventory of all WEX	possession.
	fuel cards to ensure existence and	possession.
	immediately deactivate all fuel cards not	However, the documentation received by
	located.	Internal Audit reflecting the physical inventory
	Toolitod.	was not complete for all WEX fuel cards
		maintained by the Police Department.
6	Internal controls were lacking in the City's	NOT IMPLEMENTED
	WEX fuel card online program.	TVOT TALL ESTABLISTED
	// Zii juci cui u oittiite pi ogi uitti	Based on Internal Audit review, controls in
	Management should utilize the controls	WEX were not being used and the department
	within the WEX fuel card online system	did not establish alternative controls to detect
	when possible, and when not possible,	exceptions. Internal Audit noted WEX
	alternative controls should be put in place	transactions:
	to detect exceptions.	• Exceeding the fuel capacity for the
	1	unit;
		 Wrong fuel type for the unit;
		More than one transaction in a day; and
		Purchases other than fuel.
		Turenases other than ruer.
		Following the conclusion of the audit on
		November 24, 2020, Internal Audit advised
		management the recommendation was not
		implemented. Police Department management
		subsequently implemented the recommendation
		by creating procedures, in lieu of utilizing WEX
		online controls, which requires a monthly
		review to be conducted by the Police
		Department's fuel card administrator to monitor
		for exceptions.
8	Training and accountability were not	PARTIALLY IMPLEMENTED
	required.	
		Training on the City's Fuel Card Practices and
	Management should ensure personnel sign	Procedures policy # 315 was created by the
	a fuel usage agreement that details the terms	Finance Department and distributed through
	and conditions on the proper use of the fuel	PowerDMS in September 2020. However, not
	card prior to issuing fuel cards.	all Police Department personnel received or
		completed this training.
		(see 3.2 for implementation of policies and
		procedures)
		Fellowing the conduct C d 19
		Following the conclusion of the audit on
		November 24, 2020, Internal Audit advised
		management the recommendation was partially
	<u> </u>	implemented. Police and Finance Department

		management are reissuing training to all Police
		Department personnel on March 1, 2021
		through Power DMS.
9	Fraudulent use of WEX fuel card	PARTIALLY IMPLEMENTED
	occurred.	
		The City's Fuel Card Practices and Procedures
	The Police Department implement the	policy # 315 was created and acknowledged by
	recommendations as previously presented	the department. However, the department did
	in the above findings to ensure internal	not establish processes that provided sufficient
	controls are established, followed,	internal controls as identified in the WEX Fuel
	maintained, and properly documented to	Card Compliance audit report and outlined in
	include a process to ensure adequate	the City policy. Without controls in place and a
	follow-up regarding questionable fueling	comprehensive review of WEX fuel card
	transactions.	transactions, an environment for fraudulent
		activity remains which could ultimately cause
		an increase in fuel expenditures. (Combined

Following the conclusion of the audit on November 24, 2020, Internal Audit advised management the recommendation was partially implemented. Police Department management subsequently implemented several of the recommendations as outlined in this report.

with Recommendation 2.1)



Compliance Audit 2020-02 Accounts Payable Timeliness

January 2021

Director of Internal AuditElizabeth Somerindyke

Senior Internal AuditorRose Rasmussen

Internal Auditor

Amanda Rich



OUR MISSION

Provide independent, objective assurance and consulting services designed to add value and improve the City of Fayetteville's operations.

Director of Internal Audit

Elizabeth Somerindyke

Senior Internal Auditor

Rose Rasmussen

Internal Auditor

Amanda Rich

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Executive Summary	<u></u> 1
Background	1
Findings, Recommendations and Management Responses	2
Conclusion	4

http://fayettevillenc.gov/government/city-departments/internal-audit

Mailing Address: 433 Hay Street, Fayetteville, NC 28301

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

In accordance with the Fiscal Year 2020 Audit Plan, Internal Audit conducted an audit of the timeliness of accounts payable (AP) processing. The purpose of the audit was to determine if adequate internal controls were in place to process payments in an efficient and timely manner.

The Accounts Payable Division is responsible for paying approved invoices to previously approved vendors, within specified vendor payment terms. This process is dependent on the efforts of City departments who validate the goods and services were satisfactorily received or performed and process the invoices for submission to the Accounts Payable Division in a timely manner.

The scope of the audit included AP invoices totaling approximately \$2.4 million from various suppliers and entities from January 1, 2019 to December 31, 2019. The scope of the work specifically excluded procurement card transactions, utility bills and health care costs, as these payments are generally drafted automatically.

The Office of Internal Audit concluded that there were two noteworthy areas of opportunity around timeliness of payments and controls for ACH payments. For a detailed explanation of each of the findings please refer to the appropriate finding contained in the body of this Audit Report.

- 1. Key performance indicators and policies for the timely payment of invoices had not been established.
- 2. ACH processing lacked internal controls.

BACKGROUND

The City's accounts payable function is decentralized from the Finance Department, Accounts Payable Division. The voucher entries to pay vendors and contractors after goods or services have been received are executed by accounts payable representatives in each department which are due to the Finance Department Accounts Payable Division by Friday at 4:00 PM for a check to be issued the following Friday. The Accounts Payable Division reviews the voucher entries and processes the payments. The Accounts Payable Division has three full-time equivalents (FTEs) dedicated to the payment function.

The role of the Accounts Payable staff in reimbursing vendors is only a part of the process to appropriately pay for the goods and services acquired by City staff. Purchasing and receiving of goods and services is performed by all departments in the City. Department staff procure goods and services through the Purchasing Division of the Finance Department, which provides a centralized approach for bid specification and solicitations for any apparatus, supplies, equipment, and materials for all departments. In order for the Accounts Payable Division to effectively carry out its duties, they have to collaborate with other departments, to include the Purchasing Division within the Finance Department.

AUDIT OBJECTIVES

The objectives of this audit were to evaluate policies and procedures relating to the accounts payable process and determine if internal controls over accounts payable disbursements are adequate and effective with respect to responding to risks within the City regarding the reliability and integrity of financial and operational information, effectiveness and efficiency of operations, safeguarding of assets, and compliance with laws, regulations and contracts.

AUDIT SCOPE

The scope of the audit included invoices processed from January 2019 to December 2019. Based on a 95% confidence level and a 5% tolerable deviation, Internal Audit selected 381 invoices by random sample or auditor judgement to review.

AUDIT METHODOLOGY

In order to accomplish the objectives of the audit, the Office of Internal Audit performed, but were not limited to, the following:

- Interviewed personnel from the Finance Department;
- Reviewed the City of Fayetteville General Contracting and Purchasing Practices and Procedures, North Carolina General Statutes and any other applicable memorandums or directives related to accounts payable for compliance;
- Reviewed invoices and associated documentation; and
- Considered risk of fraud, waste and abuse.

FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND MANAGEMENT'S RESPONSES

Finding 1

Key performance indicators and policies for the timely payment of invoices had not been established.

<u>Criteria</u>: Based on the Performance Management Framework for State and Local Governments developed by the ICMA, the use of performance management provides insight on how well an organization performs. More importantly the data can be used to make informed decisions and promote operational effectiveness and efficiencies.

Principle 12 of the GAO's Standards for Internal Controls requires management to implement control activities by documenting what is expected through policies and periodically review for continued relevance and effectiveness in achieving the stated objectives or addressing related risks.

<u>Condition</u>: Accounts payable did not have key performance indicators or policies established defining timely payment of invoices.

Based on information available from the sampled invoices, the average number of days for the Finance Department to issue payment were:

- 84 days from invoice date, and;
- 70 days from due date.

Defining timely payment as 30 days or less from the invoice date, 43% of the invoices sampled were considered timely.

Internal Audit noted the timeliness of payment improved when invoices were initially received by the Finance Department.

<u>Cause</u>: The Finance Department had key performance indicators, however, indicators for timely payment of invoices had not been established.

Internal Audit noted the following as possible conditions that allowed for untimely payment of invoices:

- Decentralized accounts payable process where invoices are not emailed or mailed to a centralized location for accountability.
- Purchase orders were not obtained by City departments prior to obligating purchases, as required by North Carolina General Statute 159-28 and City Policy #120. Therefore, purchase orders were issued after the invoice was received causing a delay in payment.

<u>Effect</u>: Commitments not encumbered prior to purchase and delayed vendor payments could result in overspending. Delayed payments could negatively impact the City's reputation or cause relationships to be

strained with vendors. Ultimately the City would not be able to take advantage of early pay discounts or negotiate discounts for timely payments, if available.

Recommendation

The Finance Department should:

- 1. Establish and monitor policies and key performance indicators (KPI) for the timely payment of invoices.
- 2. Modify or create a process for streamlining the receiving of invoices within individual departments in order to expedite vendor payments.
- 3. Communicate all requirements and implementation methods to ensure compliance.

Management's Response

- 1. We concur. Management is in full agreement with the recommendation.

 Management will define timely payment of invoices as 75 days from invoice date. We recognize that Net 30 is widely considered standard payment terms but due to decentralized operations, we will work toward Net 30 as a future aspirational goal. Policies will be updated to reflect the 75 day period and a 75 day KPI will be launched to measure performance. The KPI will be measured monthly to ensure invoice payments are in line with goals and to identify areas of improvement.
- 2. We partially concur. Management is in agreement with a portion of the recommendation. Accounts payable is a decentralized operation and Finance has limited control. However, we will use our authority to lead an effort for streamlining the receiving of invoices and improving the timeliness of vendor payments. Finance staff will resume enhanced departmental training following the pandemic. Training will highlight review of policy, policy updates and the importance of monitoring policy for compliance. Procedural reviews and a general reevaluation of the accounts payable process will be initiated. To ensure clarity we will discuss and determine accountability and responsibility for each task in the accounts payable process. Training will include a demonstration of established KPIs in real-time to validate the effectiveness of the department's efforts. Our goal is to encourage and promote a culture of appreciation and compliance with policies and procedures that will effectively improve the payment process.
- 3. We concur. Management is in full agreement with the recommendation.

 Management will communicate requirements and implementation methods by issuing updated policies, offering in-depth and all-inclusive training and through direct communication with departmental staff and management.

Responsible Party: 1) Christine Pressley, AP Supervisor 2) Jay Toland, CFO

Implementation Date: April 1, 2021

Finding 2

ACH processing lacked internal controls.

<u>Criteria</u>: Principle 10 of the GAO's Standards for Internal Controls requires control activities to be designed by management to achieve objectives and respond to risks, to include management controls over information processing by controlling access to data, files and programs.

Controls should be in place to ensure data exported from JD Edwards for ACH (Automated Clearing House) processing is read only and an independent review is completed after payments are submitted. User access should be limited to information technology through authorization such as providing a unique user identification or token to authorized users.

<u>Condition</u>: Payments were made to vendors by paper check or ACH. The ACH process required the Finance Department Accounting Technician to generate reports and make edits in JD Edwards followed by an

upload of the payments for processing by the financial institution. The JD Edwards file used for uploading, which includes the amount of payment and the vendor's bank account number and routing number, was exported to a document that was not in a 'read only' format and could be edited before submitting to the financial institution for processing.

Following the aforementioned ACH payment process, there was no additional review of JD Edward files to the ACH report submitted to the financial institution to ensure the vendor's bank account information was accurately exported to the financial institution.

A token code is required to log into the City's bank account to upload ACH payments. The token code was assigned to an employee but was shared by Finance Department, Accounts Payable personnel.

<u>Cause</u>: ACH processing for payments is becoming more prevalent amongst vendors. The process was recently implemented by the City and is ever evolving, but departmental instructions in place had not been updated to mitigate risks and no formal departmental policies were developed.

<u>Effect:</u> There is a risk of payment and/or bank account information being altered during ACH payment processing with the inability to determine the employee that completed the ACH data upload to the financial institution.

Recommendation

- 1. Procedures in the Finance Department should be implemented to require an independent review of ACH payments after the information is uploaded and sent to the financial institution for payment.
- 2. Personnel in the Finance Department, Accounts Payable Division should each have a unique token code for the financial institution when processing ACH payments.

Management's Response

- 1. We concur. Management is in full agreement with the recommendation.

 A process is currently in place for independent review and matching of printed checks to system generated reports and source documents prior to mailing. The ACH payment review will be an addition to this process in order to comply with and improve internal control.
- 2. We concur. Management is in full agreement with the recommendation.

 Additional tokens have been ordered and employees will be assigned a unique token for creating unique authentication credentials. System access will be granted based on assigned roles.

Responsible Party: 1) Christine Pressley, AP Supervisor 2) Jay Toland, CFO

Implementation Date: March 1, 2021

CONCLUSION

Internal Audit has concluded work on the audit of accounts payable timeliness. Based upon test work performed, Internal Audit concludes:

- 1. Defining timely payment as 30 days or less from invoice date, only 43% of the invoices sampled were paid within 30 days or less from the invoice date. Key performance indicators (KPI) defining timely payment of invoices should be established. Process streamlining of accounts payable could improve the timeliness of vendor payments.
- 2. Internal controls over the ACH process should be evaluated and updated, to include adequate review of ACH payments once files have been submitted to the financial institution for payment.

Internal Audit identified additional areas creating risks for the City of Fayetteville. These were not part of the conducted audit but will need to be addressed as the City migrates to the Oracle Cloud ERP to ensure highly effective implementation and efficient use of the new finance system:

1. Timely record transactions ensuring general ledger dates are accurate. Transactions should be timely and accurately recorded to maintain the relevance and value for financial analysis and management decisions.

Although the management responses are included in the audit report, Internal Audit does not take responsibility for the sufficiency of these responses or the effective implementation of any corrective actions.

Internal Audit would like to thank Department personnel for their assistance and numerous courtesies extended during the completion of this audit.

Distribution:

Audit Committee
Douglas J. Hewett, City Manager
Telly Whitfield, Ph.D., Assistant City Manager
Jay Toland, Chief Financial Officer



Annual Audit Plan

Fiscal Year 2021

Director of Internal Audit Elizabeth Somerindyke

Senior Internal AuditorRose Rasmussen

Internal Auditor
Amanda Rich

City of Fayetteville Office of Internal Audit Audit Work Plan 2021

A. Aud	it Projects Carried Forward from 2020 Work Plan	Estimated Hours	Total
A.1.	In Progress		
	Vector Fleet Contract	1200	
	Accounts Payable Timeliness	60	
	WEX Gas Cards Follow-up (Police only)	200	
A.2.	For Completion		
	Permitting and Inspections Follow-up	240	
	Total Hours for Audit Projects Carried Forward from 2020 Work Plan		170
B. New	Audit Projects for 2020-2021		
B.1	Initial Audit Projects		
	Police Department Confidential Funds	150	
	Wireless Communication Usage (Cell Phones)	300	
	Community Development Housing Rehabilitation Program	300	
	Changes to Employee Pay	240	
	Total Hours for New Audit Projects for 2020-2021		99
C. Follo	ow-up Projects for 2020-2021		
C .1	Initial Follow-up Audit Projects		
	Evidence and Property Management	240	
	Total Hours for Follow-up Projects for 2020-2021		24
D. Aud	it Management and Administration		
	Other City Auditor Duties	422	
	Proxy Card Review	160	
	ERP Validation and Verification Project & Risk Assessment	200	
	Office Management/Support	1612	
	Staff Development	240	
	Approved Holidays	264	
	Approved Employee Leave	412	
	Total Audit Management and Administration		<u>331</u>
	Total Hours	=	624
E. For	Future Audit Projects 2021-2026		
	Tags and Titles (CoF only)**	40	
	Small Asset Management**	240	
	Downtown Parking Collection**	960	
	Citywide Payroll Processes**	960	
	Off Boarding Access Rights**	480	
	Body Cam Policy Compliance**	480	
	Total Hours for Future Audit Projects	480	

^{**} Reflects project from prior year audit plan. Due to limited resources, project will be considered in future audit plans.

Page 1 of 3 27

A. Audit Projects Carried Forward from 2020 Work Plan

A.1.	In Progress
Vector Fleet Contract	The audit will assess whether the system of internal controls is adequate and appropriate for effective contract compliance with selected provisions of the contract as it relates to payment.
Accounts Payable Timeliness	The audit will determine if adequate controls were in place to process payments in an efficient and timely manner; review accounts payable transactions for duplicate payments; and if adequate segregation of duties and controls existed over check issuance.
WEX Gas Cards Follow-up (Police Only)	The audit will determine that previously identified audit findings have been remediated by management as stated in management's responses.

A.2. For Completion Permitting and Inspections Followup The audit will determine that previously identified audit findings have been remediated by management as stated in management's responses.

B. New Audit Projects for 2020-2021

B.1	Initial Audit Projects
Police Department Confidential Funds	The audit will be performed due to the sensitive and volatile nature of maintaining large amounts of cash on hand and in accordance with police department policy due to accreditation requirements.
Wireless Communication Usage (Cell Phones):	The audit will assess the City's wireless communication usage to identify areas of risk and opportunities for potential savings.
Community Development Housing Rehabilitation Program	The audit will assess the Housing loans (deferred loans, down payment assistance and housing rehabilitation loans and development loans) to ensure compliance with the contract with AmeriNat.
Changes to Employee Pay	The audit will determine if adjustments to and deductions from Employee base pay were properly approved, accurately calculated, processed timely and adequately supported.

C. Follow-up Projects for 2020-2021

C.1	Initial Follow-up Audit Projects
Evidence and Property Management	The audit will determine that previously identified audit findings have been remediated by management as
Follow-up	stated in management's responses.

D. Audit Management and Administration				
Other City Auditor Duties	This category describes the time that the Office of Internal Audit maintains the Fraud, Waste, and Abuse Hotline and other miscellaneous fraud reports			
Proximity Card Access Annual Review	Proximity Card Access Policy requires an annual audit of all proximity card systems to ensure proper controls were followed for activation and deactivation.			
ERP Validation and Verification Project & Risk Assessment	Support City Contractor for the purpose of evaluating the ERP transformation. Participate in the City's internal risk team for the ERP transformation.			
Office Management/Support	This category describes the time that the Office of Internal Audit spends attending meetings involving the activities and responsibilities of the Audit Committee.			
Staff Development	Professional staff of the City Auditor's Office is required to obtain professional education each year.			
Approved Holidays	This category of leave is for approved holidays for all staff.			
Approved Employee Leave	This category describes leave earned and taken each year as personal leave and leave taken for medical purposes.			

Audit Work Plan 2021

E. Future Audit Projects 2021 - 202	26
Tags and Titles (CoF only)**	A follow-up audit will be performed to determine that previously identified audit findings have been remediated by management as stated in management's responses.
Small Asset Management**	The audit will evaluate the adequacy of internal controls, effectiveness, and policy and procedure compliance of the City's small asset management system. Audit objectives may include a review to determine if processes adequately safeguard assets; selecting a sample to assure accuracy and agreement of inventory records and inventory on hand, and compliance with policies and procedures for multiple electronic devices and air cards.
Downtown Parking Collection**	The audit will evaluate the efficiency and effectiveness of the City's parking management contract with Republic Parking System. Audit objectives may include an assessment of the collection program related to leased parking and parking citations, internal controls for cashier activities, and bad debt write-off policies.
Citywide Payroll Processes**	The audit will assess the adequacy of internal controls governing the City's payroll process. Audit objectives may include a review to determine if the City's payroll processes employ effective controls to reasonably assure employees are paid accurately and timely, and payment is made to legitimate City employees. The audit will include a review of JD Edward controls and the KRONOS timekeeping system.
Off Boarding Access Rights**	The audit will evaluate the internal controls related to IT access rights during employee off boarding process. The audit will evaluate whether body worn cameras were being used and executed in accordance with
Body Cam Policy Compliance**	established laws, regulations, guidelines, policies and procedures.

^{**} Reflects project from prior year audit plan. Due to limited resources, project will be considered in future audit plans.



TO: City of Fayetteville Audit Committee

FROM: Jay C. Toland, CMA, CFO

DATE: January 28, 2021

RE: Financial Audit Preparations FYE - 2021

Relationship To Strategic Plan:

GOAL V: Sustainable Organizational Capacity, Objective A - To ensure strong financial management with fiduciary accountability and plan for future resource sustainability by aligning resources with City priorities.

Executive Summary:

The City and PWC are required by North Carolina state statute and grantor agencies to have an annual audit. The Audit Committee Charter states that the Audit Committee will recommend to the City Council the selection of the independent auditor and to continually evaluate the independence of the independent auditor.

Background:

The City and PWC's current independent auditor, RSM US LLP, has withdrawn itself from the North Carolina government market. The current staff for RSM US LLP have subsequently been employed by PBMares LLP, an audit firm with governmental experience out of Virginia.

Issues:

Staff intends to put the annual audit out to bid through the RFP process. Upon completion of the RFP process, staff will make a recommendation on selection of the independent auditor to the Audit Committee.

Budget Impact:

Audit services are budgeted on an annual basis. The RFP requires cost sheets to be included in all proposals.

Options:

n/a

Recommended Action:

Information only

Attachments:

None



Internal Audit Annual Report

Fiscal Year 2020

Director of Internal Audit

Elizabeth Somerindyke

Senior Internal Auditor

Rose Rasmussen

Internal Auditor

Amanda Rich



OUR MISSION

Provide independent, objective assurance and consulting services designed to add value and improve the City of Fayetteville's operations.

Director of Internal Audit

Elizabeth Somerindyke

Senior Internal Auditor

Rose Rasmussen

Internal Auditor

Amanda Rich

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction.	<u></u> 1
Purpose, Authority/Mission and Responsibility	1
Audit, Special Projects and Consulting Services	
Fraud, Waste and Abuse Investigations	
Leadership and Other Accomplishments	
Summary	

http://fayettevillenc.gov/government/city-departments/internal-audit

Mailing Address: 433 Hay Street, Fayetteville, NC 28301

INTRODUCTION

According to *City of Fayetteville, NC Internal Audit Charter*, the Internal Audit Director will annually report to the Audit Committee and the City Manager on the internal audit activity's purpose, authority, responsibility and performance relative to its annual audit plan. The Internal Audit Director is also responsible for reporting significant risk exposures, control issues, fraud risks, governance issues, and other matters needed or requested by the Audit Committee and the City Manager.

PURPOSE/MISSION

The mission of the Office of Internal Audit is to provide independent, objective assurance and consulting services designed to add value and improve the City of Fayetteville's operations. The Office of Internal Audit helps the City of Fayetteville's management team accomplish its objectives by bringing a systematic, disciplined approach to evaluate and improve the effectiveness of risk management, control and governance processes.

Key Performance Measures	FY 2019 Actual	FY 2020 Actual	FY 2021 Target
% of Internal Audit recommendations accepted by management	100%	100%	100%

Acceptance of audit recommendations is an indicator of service quality. In fiscal year 2020, management accepted and provided estimated implementation dates for 12 of 12 recommendations included in five audit reports issued during the fiscal year. These results exceed the 83% industry benchmark published by the Association of Local Government Auditors.

AUTHORITY

The Office of Internal Audit shall have full, free, and unrestricted access to any and all of the City of Fayetteville's records, physical properties and personnel pertinent to carrying out any engagement. All employees are expected to assist the Office of Internal Audit in fulfilling its roles and responsibilities. The internal auditors will also have free and unrestricted access to the City Council and the Audit Committee.

RESPONSIBILITY

Audit coverage will encompass, as deemed appropriate by the Internal Audit Director, independent reviews and evaluations of any and all management operations and activities to appraise:

- Measures taken to safeguard assets, including tests of existence and ownership as appropriate.
- Reliability, consistency, and integrity of financial and operating information.
- Compliance with policies, plans, standards, laws, and regulations that could have significant impact on operations.
- Economy and efficiency in the use of resources.
- Effectiveness in the accomplishment of the mission, objectives, and goals established for the City's operations and projects.
- Managing and responding to the Fraud hotline.

AUDIT SERVICES

AUDITS	STATUS
Code Violations Enforcement and Collections (A2019-06) The internal controls surrounding the processes require improvements in order to provide reasonable assurance that continuity of operations exists. The implementation of the audit recommendations should result in consistent enforcement of code violations, to include the collection of civil penalties and abatement costs. In particular, comprehensive policies and procedures should be established, followed and provide for exceptions to the City Code of Ordinances.	Report Issued August 2019
Residential Solid Waste Fees (A2019-04) The City Code of Ordinances needs updating to provide clarity on who should receive solid waste services and be assessed the residential solid waste fee. Once the City Code of Ordinances is updated, clear processes with written policies and procedures need to be established to ensure the City Code of Ordinances is being followed. Fleetmind must also be updated to reflect all active and inactive customers. The implementation of the audit recommendations should result in consistent collection of solid waste and residential solid waste fees.	Report Issued October 2019
Police Department Confidential Funds (A2020-03) The Police Department generally adhered to the organization's policies and procedures; applicable laws, regulations and guidelines during the period January 1, 2019 through October 31, 2019. The Police Department's VICE Investigative Division have continually reviewed and updated policies and procedures, which contributed to stronger controls and a general adherence to policies and procedures over confidential funds. However, Operating Procedures 6.2 and 5.8 should be updated to address prior year audit findings.	Report Issued January 2020
Police Payroll Audit (A2020-01) Since a paper timekeeping process has to be used until the electronic timekeeping system can be implemented, the Police Department payroll process needs to be updated and streamlined to ensure Police Department personnel are paid accurately and timely. In order to accomplish this, the Police Department needs to collaborate with the Finance and Human Resource Development Departments and the City Attorney's Office on any timekeeping and payroll process changes to ensure all applicable guidelines are followed. In addition, personnel involved in the timekeeping and payroll process should be thoroughly trained on all applicable guidelines related to the process to include the FLSA.	Report Pending Release
WEX Fuel Card Follow-up Audit (Fire and Finance Departments) (A2019-05F) Management implemented corrective actions to address the audit recommendations reported in the original audit.	Report Pending Release
Accounts Payable Timeliness (A2020-02) Areas of opportunity noted were establishing performance measures defining timely payment of invoices; streamlining the accounts payable process; and strengthening controls over the ACH process. In addition, as the City migrates to the Oracle Cloud ERP to ensure highly effective implementation and efficient use of the new finance system, transactions should be timely and accurately recorded to maintain the relevance and value for financial analysis and management decisions.	Report In Progress
Fleet Contract (A2020-04) The objectives of this audit were to assess whether the system of internal controls were adequate and appropriate for effective contract compliance with selected provisions of the executed contract as it relates to payments. As of June 30, 2020 this audit was still in progress.	Audit In Progress

FRAUD, WASTE AND ABUSE INVESTIGATIONS

The Office of Internal Audit also manages suspected cases of fraud, waste and abuse reported by employees, vendors and citizens. Such cases may be reported in various ways to include: in-person, telephone, e-mail or the City's Fraud Hotline. The City's Fraud Hotline is operated by a third party and reports can be made anonymously either over the telephone or online.

For fiscal year 2020, there were 8 incidents reported of which 25% were reported through the Fraud Hotline. Table 1 summarizes the various types of allegations received.

TABLE 1	25%	75%	100%
ALLEGATION TYPE	HOTLINE	NON-HOTLINE	TOTAL
Accounting/Audit Irregularities	0	1	1
Customer Relations	1	0	1
Employee Relations	0	1	1
Falsification of Company Records	0	1	1
Fraud	0	1	1
Policy Issues	1	2	3
TOTAL	2	6	8

Allegations may be investigated by the Office of Internal Audit, referred to a City department (generally for lower risk issues), referred to a non-City agency (if relating to matters outside City jurisdiction or requiring external law enforcement), and/or deemed non-actionable. Non-actionable allegations result from insufficient or dated information, prior corrective action, immateriality or inappropriate use of the Hotline. If referred to a City department, the Office of Internal Audit generally requests the department to investigate, take appropriate action and communicate the results to the Office of Internal Audit within 30 days.

Resolved allegations are categorized as: Substantiated (allegation was validated); Substantiated – No Violation (conditions cited were accurate but did not constitute a violation); Unsubstantiated; Department Resolution; or Inconclusive (available evidence is not sufficient to determine the validity of the allegation).

Table 2 summarized assignments and dispositions for allegations reported and/or resolved during fiscal year 2020.

TABLE 2	ASSIGNMENT			
DISPOSITION	REFER	TOTAL		
Department Resolution	1	0	1	
Non-Actionable	N/A	0	0	
Unsubstantiated	0	2	2	
Open/Ongoing Allegations	0	2	2	
Substantiated	0	0	0	
Substantiated – No Violation	0	3	3	
Inconclusive	0	0	0	
TOTAL	1	7	8	

The City's Fraud, Waste and Abuse Policy is intended to enhance employee awareness and reporting of suspected fraud, waste and abuse. Allegations resolved during fiscal year 2020 resulted in the following:

- Improved procedures and/or management controls;
- Employee safety improvements;
- Enhanced awareness of and/or compliance with existing regulations and/or policies; and
- Situation appropriate personnel-related actions.

LEADERSHIP AND OTHER ACCOMPLISHMENTS

The Office of Internal Audit distributed and reviewed the annual conflict of interest questionnaires provided to the Mayor, City Council, City management and a random sample of City employees as required by the City's Code of Ethics, Section 2-95(j) Conflict of Interest Questionnaire. Internal Audit personnel provided training regarding fraud, waste and abuse to approximately 146 new employees during new employee orientation (NEO). This training is on an ongoing bi-weekly basis. However, as a response to the COVID-19 Pandemic, the Internal Audit presentation was recorded, and the video was used in lieu of Internal Audit presenting in person to limit personnel contact and potential exposure. The recording was used to train approximately 72 new employees.

On a quarterly basis a Management Implementation Status Report was prepared and distributed to the Audit Committee members to help Committee members fulfill their responsibilities of oversight. Additionally, the Audit Committee members were presented a summary presentation from the City's external auditors regarding the annual financial report.

Due to the COVID-19 Pandemic, Internal Audit's training and career development for fiscal year 2020 included webinars offered through the ALGA (Association of Local Government Auditors), the IIA (Institute of Internal Auditors), the ACFE (Association of Certified Fraud Examiners), and Cherry Bekaert LLP. This training included specific training for local government auditors, ethics, fraud, and Governmental Accounting Standards updates. Additionally, personnel continue to study for the Certified Internal Auditor certification exams. Internal Audit personnel are members of ALGA, the AICPA (American Institute of Certified Public Accountants), the NCACPA (North Carolina Association of Certified Public Accountants), the IIA and the ACFE.

SUMMARY

In summary, Internal Audit staff took on new endeavors and made a strong effort to complete as many audits and projects as possible during the past fiscal year. Internal Audits success this past fiscal year was made possible as a result of the support of the City Manager's office, and the hard work of each of the department's personnel. Over the past year the strengths and skills of Internal Audit personnel developed in a way that contributed to the success of the Office. Internal Audit strived to ensure the scope of each audit engagement added value to the organization and good customer service was provided.



MEMORANDUM

January 28, 2021

TO: Audit Committee Members

FROM: Elizabeth Somerindyke, Internal Audit Director

RE: Quarterly Management Implementation Status Report

PURPOSE OF REPORT

The attached report provides members of the Audit Committee with an update on the progress of management's implementation of recommendations made by the Office of Internal Audit. Departmental management updates will be provided quarterly at each regularly scheduled Audit Committee Meeting.

The short summary of the progress updates is provided to allow a quick assessment of the audit reports where all the recommendations have NOT been fully implemented. The attached report represents updates given by management on the progress made to implement Internal Audit's recommendations. Except as otherwise noted, no assessment on the progress of the recommendations has been performed by the Office of Internal Audit.

We welcome any questions, suggestions or recommendations for improving this report to enhance your ability to monitor the effective implementation of recommendations.

		Recommendations Partially Not			NI-A	
<u>Audit Title</u>	Date Released	Issued	Accepted	Implemented	Partially Implemented	Not Implemented
Permitting and Inspections A2016-02	October 2016	35	35	35	0	0
Contract Practices and Procedures A2016-06	October 2017	3	3	3	0	0
Evidence and Property Management A2018-01	June 2018	37	36	35	0	1
Performances Measures A2018-04	January 2019	4	4	4	0	0
PRM Nonresident Fees A2016-05	January 2019	7	7	6	0	1
Code Violation Enforcement and Collections A2019-06	August 2019	7	7	7	0	0
Residential Solid Waste Fees A2019-04	October 2019	5	5	1	3	1
Police Payroll A2020-01	August 2020					
Police Department		14	14	8	3	3
Finance Department		4	4	3	0	1

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date		
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020		
A2016	A2016-05 Parks, Recreation and Maintenance Nonresident Fees Implementation					

1.1	The Office of Internal Audit	Recreation and Administrative	Implemented	Implemented
	recommends management amend	management staff will review and		
	the written Fayetteville-	amend the Fayetteville-Cumberland	This recommendation has been	This recommendation has been
	Cumberland Parks & Recreation	Parks and Recreation Non-Resident	implemented. Implementation	implemented. Implementation
	Non-Resident Fee Policy to provide	Fee Policy by May 1, 2019 with	took place during Recreation	took place during Recreation
	clear guidance on how to accurately	training to occur in May/June and	District Meetings in the month	District Meetings in the month
	and consistently charge fees. This	full implementation July 1, 2019. A	of October 2019.	of October 2019.
	policy should be amended to	new procedure will be implemented		
	include sufficient guidance to allow	to define the process for staff to		
	an individual who is unfamiliar	determine whether the resident or		
	with the operations to perform the	nonresident fees should be charged.		
	necessary activities. Finally,	The procedure will also include		
	subject matter experts should be	specific guidance on which fee to		
	included in updating and reviewing	charge residents of Fort Bragg.		
	the policy to ensure only attainable	During the review process we will		
	and realistic requirements are	determine if it is operationally		
	included. Improvements to the	feasible to charge nonresident fees		
	policy based on Internal Audit's	for pool entry, Adult Open Play and		
	observations should include, but	other similar programs. Training		
	not be limited to:	will be provided to all full-time and		
	a. Define the process for	part-time staff once the policy and		
	determining whether the	procedures are updated and ready for		
	resident or nonresident fee	implementation. Recreation and		
	should be charged;	Administrative management will		
	b. Establish specific	also develop a review process that		
	guidance on what areas, if	will ensure that fees are being		
	any, of Fort Bragg should			
	be charged the resident			

Page 1 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2016	-05 Parks, Recreation and Maintena	ance Nonresident Fees Implementation	on	
	fees; and c. Establish specific guidance and expectations on charging swimming pool and Adult Open Play Athletic fees.	Responsible Party: Adrianne Thomas, Business Manager Implementation Date: 07/01/2019		
1.2	Once the policy and procedures are updated, management should provide training to PRM personnel involved in charging and monitoring of the parks and recreation program fees.	Recreation and Administrative management staff will review and amend the Fayetteville-Cumberland Parks and Recreation Non-Resident Fee Policy by May 1, 2019 with training to occur in May/June and full implementation July 1, 2019. A new procedure will be implemented to define the process for staff to determine whether the resident or nonresident fees should be charged. The procedure will also include specific guidance on which fee to charge residents of Fort Bragg. During the review process we will determine if it is operationally feasible to charge nonresident fees for pool entry, Adult Open Play and other similar programs. Training will be provided to all full-time and part-time staff once the policy and procedures are updated and ready for	Implemented This recommendation has been implemented. Implementation took place during Recreation District Meetings in the month of October 2019.	Implemented This recommendation has been implemented. Implementation took place during Recreation District Meetings in the month of October 2019.

Page 2 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2016	-05 Parks, Recreation and Maintena	ance Nonresident Fees Implementation	on	
1.3	Management should develop a quality review program for the fees and conduct an adequate number of appropriate quality reviews in a timely manner. The documented results should be maintained and utilized as measures of effectiveness during performance evaluations.	implementation. Recreation and Administrative management will also develop a review process that will ensure that fees are being charged in accordance with the fee schedule. Responsible Party: Adrianne Thomas, Business Manager Implementation Date: 07/01/2019 Recreation and Administrative management staff will review and amend the Fayetteville-Cumberland Parks and Recreation Non-Resident Fee Policy by May 1, 2019 with training to occur in May/June and full implementation July 1, 2019. A new procedure will be implemented to define the process for staff to determine whether the resident or nonresident fees should be charged. The procedure will also include specific guidance on which fee to charge residents of Fort Bragg. During the review process we will determine if it is operationally feasible to charge nonresident fees	Implemented This recommendation has been implemented. Implementation took place during Recreation District Meetings in the month of October 2019.	Implemented This recommendation has been implemented. Implementation took place during Recreation District Meetings in the month of October 2019.

Page 3 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2016	-05 Parks, Recreation and Maintena	ance Nonresident Fees Implementation	on	
		for pool entry, Adult Open Play and other similar programs. Training will be provided to all full-time and part-time staff once the policy and procedures are updated and ready for implementation. Recreation and Administrative management will also develop a review process that will ensure that fees are being charged in accordance with the fee schedule. Responsible Party: Adrianne Thomas, Business Manager Implementation Date: 07/01/2019		
2	The Office of Internal Audit recommends management update the existing fee schedule to provide additional transparency and clarity for City Council and citizens. This should include, but not be limited to, all fees applicable for the resident and nonresident rates, and fees for regularly scheduled programs led by PRM personnel.	Recreation and Administrative management staff will review the fee schedule and update to ensure transparency and clarity regarding the PRM rates and fees. This includes the fees charged for County-wide regularly scheduled programs and services will be listed on the fee schedule reflecting the appropriate fee, to include the resident and non-resident fee, if applicable. However, the fees that	Implemented This recommendation has been implemented. The fee schedule was updated during the budget process and reflective of changes to ensure transparency and clarity. The updated fee schedule was presented to City Council for adoption and included in the FY2020 budget.	Implemented This recommendation has been implemented. The fee schedule was updated during the budget process and reflective of changes to ensure transparency and clarity. The updated fee schedule was presented to City Council for adoption and included in the FY2020 budget.

Page 4 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2016	-05 Parks, Recreation and Maintena	ance Nonresident Fees Implementation	on	
		are assigned by Recreation staff based on community interest along with the fees that are determined by contractors providing instructional programs will be reflected on the fee schedule as not applicable to the resident and non-resident fee structure. Recreation staff creativity and response to community needs may be stifled if every program they lead must be listed on the fee schedule separately, whereas, these fees will be identified as Leisure Activities. Parks and Recreation provides constantly changing and varying programs through 21 facilities in unique communities all over Cumberland County. In order for Parks and Recreation to include all programs on the fee schedule, as opposed to having them listed as under the Leisure Activity designation, would add hundreds of lines to the fee schedule for activities and limit the ability of staff to meet the needs of their communities	The FY20 Fee Schedule was implemented on July 1, 2019.	The FY20 Fee Schedule was implemented on July 1, 2019.

Page 5 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2016-05 F	Parks, Recreation and Mainten	ance Nonresident Fees Implementation	on	
		without having fees approved through City Council. Many of these programs may have the same name, but are slightly different from site to site. For example, Movie Night may be a free activity at one center and another center may charge a fee because they offer the participant dinner and a movie. Another example would be summer programs offered through the park rangers division. They offer six Page 6 of 9 different summer programs for youth and teens that would all have to be listed separately because they are of varying prices. As stated in the report "when fees are not clearly stated on the fee schedule, citizens may be unaware if the correct fee was charged and it also creates the opportunity for misappropriation or theft of funds" we disagree as fees for all programs are listed on the Fayetteville-Cumberland Parks and Recreation website.		

Page 6 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2016	-05 Parks, Recreation and Maintena	ance Nonresident Fees Implementation	on	
		Responsible Party: Adrianne Thomas, Business Manager Implementation Date: 07/01/2019		
3	The Office of Internal Audit recommends management amend the written Fayetteville-Cumberland Parks & Recreation Non-Resident Fee Policy to ensure clear guidance is provided on documentation for resident and nonresident fees. This policy should be amended to include sufficient guidance to allow an individual who is unfamiliar with the operations to perform the necessary activities. Finally, subject matter experts should be included in updating and reviewing the policy to ensure only attainable and realistic requirements are included. Improvements to the policy based on Internal Audit's observations should include, but not be limited to: a. Types of documentation	The policy already lists documentation that is acceptable, more clarification will be added as to what is not acceptable, frequency for updating documentation and document maintenance. Recreation and Administrative management staff will review and amend the Fayetteville-Cumberland Parks and Recreation Non-Resident Fee Policy by May 1, 2019 with training to occur in May/June and full implementation July 1, 2019. Responsible Party: Recreation Division Supervisor Implementation Date: 07/01/2019	Implemented This recommendation has been implemented. Implementation took place during Recreation District Meetings in the month of October 2019.	Implemented This recommendation has been implemented. Implementation took place during Recreation District Meetings in the month of October 2019.

Page 7 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2016	-05 Parks, Recreation and Maintena	ance Nonresident Fees Implementation	o n	
4.1	considered sufficient and insufficient; b. Frequency for updating documentation; and c. Documentation maintenance, retention and destruction requirements which should ensure adherence to the security of sensitive and confidential information and the State's retention requirements. Management should consider having RecTrac administration supervised by the Information Technology Department. This should not only alleviate the current conflict of interest but would allow personnel to supervise this position with knowledge of the need for segregation of duties, access controls and security over RecTrac.	After ensuring that Information Technology (IT) had the capacity to accommodate RecTrac administration, management will outline a transition plan over the next several weeks, to include the delineation of "administrative rights" and as identified in our response to Recommendation 4.2. Additionally, given RecTrac's integral role in sustaining PRM operations, it is Management's belief that dedicated technical administration is required. The creation of a RecTrac Systems Analyst in the FY21 budget would	Status Unknown	Status Unknown

Page 8 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2016	-05 Parks, Recreation and Maintena	ance Nonresident Fees Implementation	on	
4.2	Management should review RecTrac user accesses to ensure users only have access for which there is a necessary business need. This should include but not be limited to determining if a necessary business need exists for the ability to change receipt and general ledger dates, drawers, and pay codes.	enhance day-to-day support/user experience, identify and resolve issues and improve process efficiencies as online transactions grow. Responsible Party: Michael Gibson, PRM Director and Adrianne Thomas, Business Manager Implementation Date: 03/01/2019 Access will be updated for Recreation Division Supervisors to restrict access and the ability to change receipt and general ledger dates, drawers, and pay codes. This access will be updated by February 1, 2019 and remain with the Business Manager and Management Analysts only until PRM management can outline and implement a transition plan as identified in Management's Response 4.1, to include collaborating with Finance management on the impact the	Implemented This recommendation has been implemented. Access to change receipt and general ledger dates, drawers, and pay codes has been restricted to Business Manager and Management Analysts only.	Implemented This recommendation has been implemented. Access to change receipt and general ledger dates, drawers, and pay codes has been restricted to Business Manager and Management Analysts only.
		process changes will have on the day-to-day operations.		

Page 9 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
			Management Follow-up	Management Follow-up
	Recommendation	Management Response	Response – January 28, 2021	Response – October 22, 2020
A2016-	-05 Parks, Recreation and Maintena	ance Nonresident Fees Implementation	on	
		Responsible Party: Michael		
		Gibson, PRM Director and Adrianne		
		Thomas, Business Manager		
		Implementation Date: 03/01/2019		

Page 10 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2019	A2019-04 Residential Solid Waste Fees			

1.1	The Office of Internal Audit	Management will seek council	Partially Implemented	Not Implemented
	recommends management:	direction regarding level/scope of		
		solid waste services. Full	Solid Waste Management asked	Solid Waste Management is in
	1. Solicit City Council's support	implementation of	three consultant firms for	the process of reviewing the
	on updates necessary to the	'Recommendation #1' is contingent	proposals to revise the Solid	Solid Waste Ordinance and has
	City Code of Ordinances	upon continuation of the 'existing'	Waste Ordinance by:	completed a number of internal
	Chapter 22, Solid Waste as it		• Researching and	meetings.
	will be essential to ensure	waste division with no significant	presenting Model	
	adherence to the City Code of	additions such as service to multi-	Ordinances.	Management will seek Council
	Ordinances;	family units or commercial facilities.	Recommend Operational	support and guidance regarding
			changes in the ordinance	the City's Level of Service
		Responsible Party: Public Services	that will enhance solid	Expectations in the format of a
		Director	waste services and	preliminary work session
			collections.	presentation. Original
		Implementation Date:	1	completion date for this was
		Management will seek Council	violations through Best	April 30, 2020. Due to COVID
		support in the format of a	Practice.	19 this presentation has been
		preliminary work session	· ·	postponed. Staff is on calendar
		presentation by April 30, 2020 and	the ordinance is	to present to Council on October
		follow up ordinance updates by	understandable for easy	12, 2020. Full ordinance
		September 30, 2020 contingent upon	compliance.	amendments pending Council
		continuation of the 'existing'	D 1 : : : : 1	approval is expected August
		level/scope of services within the	Purchasing is in the process of	2021.in Nov 2020.
		solid waste division.	creating a GSA with GBB to	
			revise the SW Ordinance. The	
			estimated delivery time for the	
			final ordinance is 13-15 weeks,	
			approximately April 30, 2021.	

Page 11 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2019	-04 Residential Solid Waste Fees			
1.2	The Office of Internal Audit recommends management: 2. Coordinate with the City Attorney's office to update the City Code of Ordinances to allow solid waste services to be provided consistently and ensure the residential solid waste fees are being assessed appropriately. Any updates to the City Code of Ordinances should ensure compliance with North Carolina General Statutes.	Management will seek council direction regarding level/scope of solid waste services. Full implementation of 'Recommendation #1' is contingent upon continuation of the 'existing' level/scope of services within solid waste division with no significant additions such as service to multifamily units or commercial facilities. Responsible Party: Public Services Director Implementation Date: Management will seek Council support in the format of a preliminary work session presentation by April 30, 2020 and follow up ordinance updates by September 30, 2020 contingent upon continuation of the 'existing' level/scope of services within the solid waste division.	Full ordinance amendments approval is expected in June 2021. Partially Implemented Solid Waste Management asked three consultant firms for proposals to revise the Solid Waste Ordinance by: Researching and presenting Model Ordinances. Recommend Operational changes in the ordinance that will enhance solid waste services and collections. Recommend penalties for violations through Best Practice. Ordinance clarity — ensure the ordinance is understandable for easy compliance. Purchasing is in the process of creating a GSA with GBB to revise the SW Ordinance. The	Not Implemented Solid Waste Management is in the process of reviewing the Solid Waste Ordinance and has completed a number of internal meetings. Management will seek Council support and guidance regarding the City's Level of Service Expectations in the format of a preliminary work session presentation. Original completion date for this was April 30, 2020. Due to COVID 19 this presentation has been postponed. Staff is on calendar to present to Council on October 12, 2020. Full ordinance amendments pending Council approval is expected August 2021.
			estimated delivery time for the	

Page 12 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date		
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020		
A2019	2019-04 Residential Solid Waste Fees					
2.1	The Office of Internal Audit	Managamant	final ordinance is 13-15 weeks, approximately April 30, 2021. Full ordinance amendments approval is expected in June 2021.			
2.1	The Office of Internal Audit recommends management: 1. Update the customer addresses in Fleetmind consistent with current routes.	Management concurs with recommendations to update the customer address in Fleetmind consistent with the current routes and existing level of service. Services will be field verified and updated into Fleetmind one record at a time. Responsible Party: Public Services Director Implementation Date: Public Services Solid Waste Division will update the customer address in FleetMind consistent with the current routes and existing level of service by March 31, 2020.	The initial upload for Fleetmind of residential household & yard waste customers is completed. The total number uploaded were 627 customers with both HH & YW services to total 1258 records uploaded. This was completed January 17, 2020. Staff is working on a comprehensive overhaul of the records which is expected to be completed March 2021.	Implemented The initial upload for Fleetmind of residential household & yard waste customers is completed. The total number uploaded were 627 customers with both HH & YW services to total 1258 records uploaded. This was completed January 17, 2020. Staff is working on a comprehensive overhaul of the records which is expected to be completed March 2021.		
2.2	The Office of Internal Audit recommends management: 2. Develop a process to add, activate and inactivate	Management concurs with the need to develop a process to add, activate and inactivate addresses in Fleetmind to maintain a current, accurate, and valid data base.	Partially Implemented Solid Waste continues to explore options on how to update the current data base that	Partially Implemented Solid Waste continues to explore options on how to update the current data base that		

Page 13 of 29 51

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2019	-04 Residential Solid Waste Fees			
	addresses in Fleetmind as needed to maintain current, accurate, valid data.	However this process is contingent upon the outcomes of 'Recommendation #1'. Further, full implementation of these processes involves compliance and cooperation from entities outside the direct control and influence of the Solid Waste Division such as CoF's Planning Division, Cumberland County and FleetMind Vendor. Implementation dates provided below are for those activities that are within the direct control and influence of the Solid Waste Division as well as what can be accomplished within Council appropriated budgetary limits. Responsible Party: Public Services Director Implementation Date: Public Services Solid Waste Division will develop a process to add, activate and inactivate addresses in	Fleetmind uses for addresses. This step is necessary to help develop a 'process' to add, activate and inactivate addresses in Fleetmind to maintain a current, accurate, and valid data base. Furtherfull implementation is contingent upon "Recommendation #1." Partially Implemented Solid Waste has received the updated CAMA data from County and is vetting the data, which is expected to be completed in February 2021. Fleetmind data will still need to be updated upon "Recommendation 1", and once the new tax levy is available and the data has been vetted.	Fleetmind uses for addresses. This step is necessary to help develop a 'process' to add, activate and inactivate addresses in Fleetmind to maintain a current, accurate, and valid data base. Furtherfull implementation is contingent upon "Recommendation #1." Partially Implemented Solid Waste has updated the customer records and routing data for Fleetmind to coincide with CAMA data and Cityworks data. Fleetmind data will still need to be updated upon "Recommendation 1", and once the new tax levy is available, and the data has been vetted.

Page 14 of 29

Fleetmind to maintain a current, accurate, and valid data base by June

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2019	-04 Residential Solid Waste Fees			
2.3	The Office of Internal Audit recommends management: 3. Develop comprehensive written policies and procedures to maintain Fleetmind data integrity, once the processes are established.	30, 2022 contingent upon management responses. Management concurs with the need to develop comprehensive written policies and procedures to maintain Fleetmind data integrity. However this process is contingent upon the outcomes of 'Recommendation #1". Further, full implementation of these processes involves compliance and cooperation from entities outside the direct control and influence of the Solid Waste Division such as CoF's Planning Division, Cumberland County and FleetMind Vendor. Implementation dates provided below are for those activities that are within the direct control and influence of the Solid Waste Division as well as what can be accomplished within Council appropriated budgetary limits. Responsible Party: Public Services	Not Implemented Solid Waste Management will begin writing policies and procedures to maintain data integrity for Fleetmind once the Solid Waste Ordinance has been updated.	Not Implemented Solid Waste Management will begin writing policies and procedures to maintain data integrity for Fleetmind once the Solid Waste Ordinance has been updated.
		Director Implementation Date: Public Services Solid Waste Division will		

Page 15 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2019-04 Residential Solid Waste Fees				
		develop comprehensive written		
		policies and procedures to maintain		
		Fleetmind data integrity by June 30,		
		2022 contingent upon management		
		responses.		

Page 16 of 29

Implemented

Past Implementation Date

Partially Implemented

KEY

Not Implemented

	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2020	-01 Police Department Payroll Audi	t: Finance Department		
	· · · · · ·	-		
6.1	The Office of Internal Audit recommends: 1. Management should coordinate with the Human Resource Development Department to develop comprehensive timekeeping and payroll training. The training should include applicable FLSA regulations, City policy and procedure manuals, and how to process time and attendance for payroll purposes.	It should be the priority of the City to provide up-to-date and timely training especially in payroll processing. Training will help ensure best practices and procedures. Responsible Party: Jay Toland, Chief Financial Officer Implementation Date: 12/1/2020	Implemented OD&T and Finance met 1.15.2021 and drafted a comprehensive timekeeping and payroll training. Training will be disbursed/deployed no later than 3.1.2021	Current practice is "Train the trainer". Finance-Payroll staff provide training to the Payroll Preparer for each department and they train all other department payroll staff. In November the Finance Department will coordinate with the Human Resource Development Department to develop comprehensive timekeeping and payroll training. The training shall include applicable FLSA regulations, City policy and procedure manuals, and how to process time and attendance for
6.2	The Office of Internal Audit	Finance will work with the	Not Implemented	payroll purposes. Not Implemented
	recommends:	departments as new payroll preparers are brought on-line to	Training will be released	Initial training is hannaning and
	2. Management should ensure all	ensure the preparers have initial	Training will be released through POWERDMS and/or in	Initial training is happening and finance currently offer one on
	payroll preparer and reviewers	training. Furthermore a refresher	person/zoom (with a sign-in	one refresher training as needed
	take training developed prior to	course will be created and	sheet) to create a system of	and/or requested.
	assuming the respective duties	disseminated in an efficient manner.	record for training.	and/or requested.
	assuming the respective duties	uissemmateu in an efficient manner.	record for training.	

Page 17 of 29 55

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2020	-01 Police Department Payroll Audi	t: Finance Department		
	and should be required to take a refresher training annually.	Chief Financial Officer		Finance is currently working to develop the refresher course
6.3	The Office of Internal Audit recommends: 3. Management should coordinate with the Human Resources Development Department to provide the Police Department training on timekeeping and FLSA 207 (k) overtime. Training for new employees should be a part of on-boarding and provided by a qualified employee.	Implementation Date: 12/1/2020 Finance will collaborate with HRD to provide training on timekeeping and FLSA 207 (k) overtime and an on-boarding process to train new employees. Responsible Party: Jay Toland, Chief Financial Officer Implementation Date: 12/1/2020	Implemented OD&T and Finance met 1.15.2021 and drafted a comprehensive training on timekeeping and FLSA 207 (k) overtime. Training for new employees shall be a part of onboarding and provided by a qualified employee. Training will be deployed/disbursed no later than 3.1.2021.	Not Implemented Kronos for regular employees is part of NEO. PD will be trained during PD implementation into Kronos. New PD employee training takes place in the department.
6.4	The Office of Internal Audit recommends: 4. Management should designate funding for the payroll supervisor to obtain a Payroll Certification and allow the payroll supervisor to obtain this certification.	Finance will look at the budgeting process to earmark funds for certification. Responsible Party: Jay Toland, Chief Financial Officer Implementation Date: 12/1/2020	Implemented Budget has been requested for certification from the American Payroll Association.	Not Implemented Finance will earmark appropriate funds for certification.

Page 18 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2020-01 Police Department Payroll Audit: Police Department				

1		Management worked with the	Implemented – 9/1/2020	Implemented – 9/1/2020
	recommends the Police	Finance Department and obtained an		
	Department, to include E-911,	updated timecard and proposed	The department is in compliance	The department is in compliance
	consult with the Finance	training to be provided to the police	with entering time from	with entering time from
	Department on streamlining the	department by the end of August	timesheets but still submit a	timesheets but still submit a
	manual timekeeping and payroll	2020. Management agreed with the	summary sheet. Now working	summary sheet. Now working
	processes, to include eliminating	streamlined process for payroll and	with Kronos time entry also.	with Kronos time entry also.
	the summary sheets and use	the importance of accountability and		
	timecards to enter the time and	oversight needed to ensure accurate		
	attendance into JD Edwards, with	and timekeeping of personnel.		
	the end goal of moving towards	Management has direct the payroll		
	implementing an automated time	technician to enter the time into JD		
	and attendance system.	Edwards from the employee's		
		timecard but will continue to have		
		supervisory personnel complete a		
		summary sheet based. The		
		completion of the summary sheet is		
		also aligned with the		
		recommendations from the Finance		
		Department and the Audit		
		Department to having a checklist of		
		multiple items for supervisors to		
		review on the timecards prior to		
		being submitted for entry into JD		
		Edwards. The ultimate goal of		
		having minimal errors and within the		
		timeline needed for the Finance		
		Department to process payroll. The		

Page 19 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2020	01 Police Department Payroll Audi	t: Police Department		
		city has started the implementation of the automated time and attendance system for the police department and this has a starting timeline of September 2020. Responsible Party: Chief Gina V. Hawkins		
2.1	The Office of Internal Audit	Implementation Date: 9/1/2020	II	II are creted 0/1/2020
2.1	The Office of Internal Audit recommends management, to include E-911: 1. Require employee and supervisor signatures, and dates signed on all timekeeping	The Finance Department created an updated timecard and training should be implemented by the end of August 2020. Responsible Party: Chief Gina V. Hawkins	Implemented – 9/1/2020 Employee and Supervisor signatures and dates on timecards.	Implemented – 9/1/2020 Employee and Supervisor signatures and dates on timecards.
	forms.	Tia Willia		
		Implementation Date: 9/1/2020		
2.2	The Office of Internal Audit recommends management, to include E-911: 2. Consult with the Finance Department to create department-wide standardized timekeeping forms that at a minimum capture all time	The Finance Department created an updated timecard and training should be implemented by the end of August 2020. Responsible Party: Chief Gina V. Hawkins	Implemented – 9/1/2020	Implemented – 9/1/2020
	worked to include court time,	Implementation Date: 9/1/2020		

Page 20 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2020	-01 Police Department Payroll Audi	t: Police Department		
3.1	compensatory time and overtime earned, scheduled hours and leave taken. This change will ensure consistency of documentation supporting timekeeping within the department. If the department deviates from approved standardized timekeeping forms, authorization should be obtained from the Finance Department. The Office of Internal Audit recommends management: 1. Require timecards be submitted only after all hours have been worked for the pay period.	Management changed the submission due dates of all timecards in the first quarter of 2020 when issues were presented. Although there may be more corrections due to call-in or incidents when personnel have to come in after the time has been forwarded to the payroll technician, every effort will be made to submit time and not project time. The police department has been working with the I.T. Department and the Finance Department on the implementation of the automated time and attendance system in order to make	Implemented — 9/1//2020	Implemented – 9/1//2020

Page 21 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2020	-01 Police Department Payroll Audi	t: Police Department		
		this recommendation work efficiently. Responsible Party: Chief Gina V. Hawkins		
		Implementation Data 0/1/2020		
3.2	The Office of Internal Audit recommends management: 2. Coordinate with the Finance Department to implement a process that will ensure FLSA 207 (k) overtime is paid correctly for all prior period work hours.	Implementation Date: 9/1/2020 Management has coordinated with the Finance Department and the Finance Department has advised they are working on implementing a process to ensure corrections for prior period work are accurate and in accordance with the 207 (k) rule. The police department is unable to ensure the FLSA 207 (k) is implement but have already discussed this with Finance. Responsible Party: Chief Gina V. Hawkins	Implemented – 9/1/2020	Implemented – 9/1/2020
		Implementation Date: 9/1/2020		
4	The Police Department, to include E-911, should ensure a qualified independent employee, with a complete understanding of payroll, consistently review, every payroll	The department has existing personnel which have been trained and will continue to be trained on all aspects of FLSA and the City of Fayetteville Payroll Process as it is	Implemented – 9/1/2020	Implemented – 9/1/2020

Page 22 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2020	-01 Police Department Payroll Audi	t: Police Department		
	period, all JD Edward payroll authorization reports back to the source documents (timecards) before payroll is submitted to the Finance Department Payroll Division for processing. Operating Procedure 10.2 Personnel and Payroll should be updated accordingly.	changing. The department will also ensure the supervisory staff receive training on the existing topics which has not been provided in the past. Management believe errors stem from education of all staff and will first have to depend on the training from Finance before we can determine who the secondary "independent" employee with all the qualifications listed above will be. The other issue with the recommendation is the ability to have the review completed "before payroll is submitted to the Finance Department Payroll Division for processing" will not provide the payroll technician the needed time to enter from the actual 600 timecards approximately within the allotted deadline for the Finance Department. The operational time needed for entries already required between 10-12 hours of data entry. The department will update our operating procedures after all changes once we have received the approved timecards and processes		

Page 23 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2020	01 Police Department Payroll Audi	t: Police Department		
5.1	The Office of Internal Audit recommends management:	from the Finance Department on procedures and documented processes which will be made. Responsible Party: Chief Gina V. Hawkins Implementation Date: 9/1/2020 Management concurs with item #1 and have already uploaded previous years and template the timesheets	Implemented – 10/1/2020 All prior timecards have been	Implemented – 10/1/2020 All prior timecards have been
	1. Establish a central recordkeeping location for all payroll related records and identify departmental position(s) responsible to ensure payroll records are complete and archived.	into Laserfiche. This process is being completed after all time has been entered for a pay period but before the next pay period starts by Office Assistants. Responsible Party: Chief Gina V. Hawkins Implementation Date: 10/1/2020	archived, template and laserfiche into the system.	archived, template and laserfiche into the system.
5.2	The Office of Internal Audit	For Item #2, Management will have	Not Implemented	Not Implemented
	Review all current written departmental operating procedures related to Personnel and Payroll with the Human Resource	the Police Attorney review all operating procedures related to payroll once the Finance Department has completed the updated timecards and their procedures and documented	City Attorney still reviewing all policies to ensure they are FLSA Compliant now and when we transition into Kronos. The department has been in constant	City Attorney still reviewing all policies to ensure they are FLSA Compliant now and when we transition into Kronos. The department has been in constant

Page 24 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2020	-01 Police Department Payroll Audi	t: Police Department		
	Development Department and the	processes and ensure they align with	communication with Payroll and	communication with Payroll and
	City Attorney's Office to ensure	the City of Fayetteville Policies. We	the I.T. Department regarding	the I.T. Department regarding
	compliance with the FLSA.	will then provide the information for	issues with timecards and	issues with timecards and
		Human Resource Development	calculations in order to be FLSA	calculations in order to be FLSA
		Department for review.	Compliant.	Compliant.
		Responsible Party: Chief Gina V. Hawkins	Still working on.	Implementation Date: 1/1/2020
		Hawkins	Revised Implementation	
		Implementation Date: 10/1/2020	Date :03/01/2021	
5.3	The Office of Internal Audit	Management will consult with the	Not Implemented	Not Implemented
	recommends management:	City Manager and Human Resources		,
	8	regarding items #3 and #4 in order to	Department will have this	Department will have this
	3. Document an approval process	determine if this recommendation	reviewed with the policies being	reviewed with the policies being
	for overtime within the	should be a part of the City Policy in	reviewed by the City Attorney's	reviewed by the City Attorney's
	departmental operating	order to ensure equitable treatment	office in order to be a part of the	office in order to be a part of the
	procedures, to include a	of overtime, even though the sworn	operating procedures.	operating procedures.
	consideration for equitable	personnel is on the 7(k) Rule. There		
	treatment of overtime.	may be an infinite number of	Still working on.	Implementation Date: 1/1/2020
		scenarios in which working over a		
		prescheduled day could apply and	Revised Implementation	
		not be considered overtime. Based	Date: 03/01/2021	
		on the previous response with		
		training on FLSA 207 (k) and other		
		FLSA to supervisory staff, the		
		existing FLSA 207 (K) rule is clear		
		and covers all situations when		
		someone can be paid compensatory		

Page 25 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2020	-01 Police Department Payroll Audi	t: Police Department		
		time versus overtime and does not need to be included in departmental operational procedures. Responsible Party: Chief Gina V.		
		Hawkins		
		Implementation Date: 10/1/2020		
5.4	The Office of Internal Audit recommends management: 4. Update departmental operating	Management will consult with the City Manager and Human Resources regarding items #3 and #4 in order to determine if this recommendation	Not Implemented Department will have this reviewed with the policies being	Not Implemented Department will have this reviewed with the policies being
	procedures to align with current practices, to include criteria for when overtime is allowed versus earning	should be a part of the City Policy in order to ensure equitable treatment of overtime, even though the sworn personnel is on the 7(k) Rule. There	reviewed by the City Attorney's office in order to be a part of the operating procedures.	reviewed by the City Attorney's office in order to be a part of the operating procedures.
	compensatory time.	may be an infinite number of scenarios in which working over a	Still working on.	Implementation Date: 1/1/2020
		prescheduled day could apply and	Revised Implementation	
		not be considered overtime. Based on the previous response with	Date: 03/01/2021	
		training on FLSA 207 (k) and other FLSA to supervisory staff, the		
		existing FLSA 207 (K) rule is clear		
		and covers all situations when		
		someone can be paid compensatory time versus overtime and does not		

Page 26 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2020	-01 Police Department Payroll Audi	t: Police Department		
6.1	The Office of Internal Audit recommends: 1. Management consider creating and hiring an accounting manager position with the expertise in business processes and internal controls to oversee	need to be included in departmental operational procedures. Responsible Party: Chief Gina V. Hawkins Implementation Date: 10/1/2020 The police department has submitted a new initiative for a position which will cover more than just the recommendation listed as an accounting manager but cannot control if this position will be approved. The position will ensure the business aspect of the police	Partially Implemented Position was approved and department in the hiring process for this position. New Hire should start by 03/01/2021.	Not Implemented Position not approved in budget.
	the Personnel Technician position and assist in developing, implementing and evaluating the necessary payroll controls to improve efficiency and ensure compliance with applicable guidelines. Although additional personnel is costly, the City could be fined for FLSA violations and due to the Department's payroll expenditures for Fiscal year	department has continuity for long term overall efficiency. Responsible Party: Chief Gina V. Hawkins Implementation Date: 12/1/2020	Revised Implementation Date: 03/01/2021	

Page 27 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2020	-01 Police Department Payroll Audi	t: Police Department		
	ending 2019 of \$40.1 million, the fines could be costly.			
6.2	The Office of Internal Audit recommends: 2. Management needs to ensure the Personnel Technician and an alternate employee are thoroughly trained and have a clear understanding of all applicable guidelines.	Management has requested Finance provide training for any and all employees who have access to JDE before the receive approval rights into the system. Once this training has occurred management will determine who would be the possible alternate employee. This training should include a documented manual for the training for the employee to reference. Responsible Party: Chief Gina V. Hawkins	Department has begun cross training another employee in the department on duties. Department will also be hiring a new Administrative Manager to assist with this. Implementation Date: 03/01/2021	Partially Implemented Department has begun cross training another employee in the department on duties. Implementation Date: 12/1/2020
7	The Office of Internal Audit recommends management collaborate with the Finance Department on the current timekeeping and payroll processes to improve the efficiency which should reduce the errors of employee wages and ensure hours worked are accurately and consistently documented in JD	As previously mentioned Finance created updated timecard and will be providing training. Management does not agree with non-sworn timecards entering time on a 1 week basis. The supervisory staff who will be approving the timecards will be trained on the process and will need a consistent training manual to review for all personnel. The	Partially Implemented - 9/1/2020 As previously mentioned.	Partially Implemented - 9/1/2020 As previously mentioned.

Page 28 of 29

KEY	Not Implemented	Partially Implemented	Implemented	Past Implementation Date
	Recommendation	Management Response	Management Follow-up Response – January 28, 2021	Management Follow-up Response – October 22, 2020
A2020	-01 Police Department Payroll Audi	t: Police Department		
	Edwards as reflected on timecards. However, time worked for non-exempt/non-sworn personnel should be maintained on weekly timecards and entered on a 1-week basis.	updated timecards provided by Finance calculate time appropriately based on sworn or non-sworn personnel. The automated system will also have time submitted for on a bi-weekly basis for approval. Responsible Party: Chief Gina V. Hawkins		
8	The Office of Internal Audit recommends the Police Department, to include E-911, consult with the Human Resources Department on a formal leave request process to ensure leave time is reported. Although an automated time and attendance is being implemented, consequences for non-compliance should be clearly defined in written departmental operating procedures.	Implementation Date: 9/1/2020 Management will consult with the Human Resource Department to obtain how all other City of Fayetteville departments which are not on an automated system submit their formal leave request. In the meantime the department has already created a formal leave request form and ensure it is included in the department's operational process and coincides with City Policy. Responsible Party: Chief Gina V. Hawkins Implementation Date: 6/1/2020	Implemented	Implemented

Page 29 of 29